HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

	934 O Street NW Blagden Alley/Naylor Court Historic District	,) Agenda) Consent Calendar
		() Denial Calendar
		(X) Concept Review
		() Permit
Meeting Date:	December 19, 2019	(X) Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	#20-054	() New Construction
		() Demolition
		() Subdivision

The applicant, Sean Ruppert on behalf of owner 934 O Street NW LLC, seeks conceptual review to add a second story to a one-story garage at 934 O Street NW in the Blagden Alley/Naylor Court Historic District. Plans were prepared by GPS Designs Architecture.

Property Description and Context

Blagden Alley and Naylor Court Historic District was designated in 1990 as a significant example of 19th century working class housing and for its association with the early 20th century social reform movement. The relationship between large formal rowhouses on streets and small spartan dwellings on the alleys is a hallmark of this historic district. The alleys of this historic district also feature workshops, stables, garages and a handful of large commercial buildings. The rowhouse at 934 O Street NW was built in 1882 and sits along the alley that leads to the interior of Naylor Court. At the rear of its lot is a one-story, three-bay garage built several decades later in 1915 to accommodate rising automobile ownership. The garage is unornamented and stuccoed on all sides.

Project Summary

The applicant proposes to add a second story to the garage stuccoed to match the existing finish and replace the metal garage doors with wood carriage doors. The second floor would be fenestrated with six-over-one windows over the garage doors and horse windows on its south elevation and yard elevation. The rear of the rowhouse would also receive attention by enclosing the ground floor of the existing two-story porch, replacing the porch components at the second floor and replacing a CMU garden wall at the alley with a brick garden wall.

Evaluation and Recommendation

Adding a second story to the garage produces an alley building that matches the size, massing, roof shape and scale of the many two-story historic buildings in Naylor Court. The existing garage has no distinct architectural relationship with the rowhouse and the high degree of alteration already done to it substantially reduces its importance and integrity. The work at the rear of the rowhouse will replace a collection of non-original alterations with a coordinated and compatible package of historic materials and components.

The concept requires one revision to respect the hierarchical relationship of rowhouses and alley buildings in the historic district. The cornice drawn for all sides of the second story of the garage should be removed so that the building is not ornamented like a rowhouse. At the roof above the

garage doors a simple ogee cornice or two courses of rick corbelling would be sufficient to demarcate this side of the building as the front. The other walls could be capped simply with metal coping or flashing. Simplifying the materials and ornament this way will better match the utilitarian character typical of the surrounding alley buildings.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Review Board find the concept for a one-story addition to the garage at 934 O Street NW to be compatible with the character of the historic district, consistent with the purpose of the preservation act, and that final approval be delegated to Staff.

Staff contact: Brendan Meyer