HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Property Address:	1319 11th Street NW	() Agenda
Landmark/District:	Shaw Historic District	(X) Consent Calendar
		() Denial Calendar
		(X) Concept Review
		() Permit Review
Meeting Date:	February 24, 2022	() Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	22-138	(X) New Construction
		(X) Demolition
		() Subdivision

The applicant, owner Jerome Bailey, seeks concept review for construction of a four-story 8-unit residential building at 1319 11th Street NW. The existing building is a non-contributing property in the Shaw Historic District and would be demolished. Plans were prepared by Square 134 Architects.

Property Description and Context

1319 11th Street NW is part of a row of nine, two-story houses built in 1977. They do not contribute to the character of the Shaw Historic District and exhibit many architectural details that are not consistent with the historic houses of Shaw. Rather than sitting uniformly on the front property line, the houses are set back from the front property line and alternately staggered. The pattern of unaligned facades differs from the aligned facades typical of historic rows of houses. The continuous mansard roofs are disproportionately large and low compared to historic examples found in historic Shaw.

Proposal

The proposal is the same concept and by the same architect as two previous ones approved by the Board, and now constructed, (See Figure A).¹ The two previous designs differed in detail only, the most prominent difference being that the bay of the second house is millwork composite construction instead of masonry. The current house at 1319 would be demolished and replaced with a four-story rowhouse with a projecting masonry bay to more closely match the first house. The façade would align on the front property line and have a two-story bay projecting into public space. The fourth story is expressed as a mansard roof with dormers; one larger and engaged with the façade brick and one smaller and set back slightly above the cornice. The entrance would be raised above the street to accommodate a raised basement and basement entrance.

Evaluation

Questions of design and preservation principles regarding compatibility for 1319 11th Street were essentially determined by the Board's approval of the same concept design for 1313 11th Street.²

¹ HPA 19-145, 1313 11th Street NW (January 2019) and HPA 20-041, 1317 11th Street NW (November 2019)

² 1313 11th Street NW, HPA 19-145, April 4, 2019, "The Board found a concept to demolish 1313 11thStreet NW and build a projecting bay rowhouse with mansard roof and two-story projecting bay to be compatible with the character of the historic district, consistent with the purpose of the preservation act, and that final approval be delegated to staff." Vote:8-0

The existing row of houses does not contribute to the character of the historic district, and the concept design for 1319 produces an acceptable contemporary version of a Victorian rowhouse that is compatible with the general character of the Shaw Historic District.

With the new benefit of two constructed examples, the first house with the masonry bay shows itself to be the more compatible material choice. Its uniformity of material between its bay and front wall is consistent with the material pattern of historic rowhouses. The second house with the millwork bay is inconsistent with this pattern and produces a façade component too pronounced because of its contrasting material. The concept design for this project is for a brick bay and this material choice should not be revised during any subsequent final permit review.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the concept to demolish 1319 11th Street NW and build a new four-story, projecting bay rowhouse to be compatible with the character of the historic district, consistent with the purpose of the preservation act, and that final approval be delegated to staff.





Figure A. The first house built (1313 11th Street) is on the right with the masonry bay. The second house built (1317 11th Street is on the left with the millwork bay.