HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Landmark/District: **Mount Pleasant Historic District** () Agenda 3118-3120 16th Street NW (x) Consent Address:

Meeting Date: June 23, 2016 (**x**) Addition Case Number: 16-312 (x) Alteration

(x) Subdivision

Staff Reviewer: Tim Dennée (**x**) Revised concept

Applicant Rich Markus, architect and agent for the property owner, Pleasant 16th LLC, requests the further review of a concept to combine two buildings—which will require a subdivision and to construct rear, roof and side additions. The combined houses would become a condominium apartment building.

The Board has seen the project three times. On June 2, the Board unanimously supported the consolidation of the two lots, the connection of the houses with only the necessary demolition, the construction of a two-story addition atop the side wing of 3118 16th Street (to be further revised and lowered), and the construction of a third story atop the rear wing of 3120 16th Street. The Board supported the idea of a roof addition, but only if it is made invisible or only minimally visible from 16th Street.

Demolition

The proposed demolition of exterior and bearing walls is still quite considerable, but it is at least portrayed more carefully. Still, some of the walls to be removed appear to be bearing the loads of floor joists and rafters. Eventual permit drawings should show this framing being retained, supported by new structure, because its loss could tip the project over into constituting demolition of the buildings "in significant part." Floor framing might be removed, too, in an effort to level the floors between the buildings. If the final plans show removal of the floor framing, the permit will be referred back to the Board with a recommendation that the project is inconsistent with the preservation act.

Rear elevation

The rear walls are now proposed to be brick.

Side addition

The applicant has lowered the roof of the side addition and made that structure more porch-like. It should be lowered still more, as the house eave cuts across its cornice, and its floor and ceiling heights do not appear to match those of 3118. It should also be built atop the existing one-story brick wing, retaining the tile roof, rather than replacing it with a third level of "porch," as a matter of reducing demolition and producing better proportions. Retaining the original brick portion would relieve the need to make each floor's openings the same height, allowing the whole to be further lowered.

Rooftop mechanical

With the lowering of the side addition, the rooftop mechanical equipment has been relocated, some to the ground (not shown) and some to the northwest corner of the roof of the roof addition (also not depicted).

Roof addition

The roof addition has been shifted farther back northward. Its design is underdeveloped, on the premise that it would scarcely be seen from 16th Street.

In fact, the structure is very likely to be more visible from the street than the drawings portray given, for instance, the fact that the vent and chimney on the north edge of 3118 are visible from across 16th Street (see photo below). There is also a strong likelihood that the addition—which is shown as only 8'6" from floor surface to rooftop—will be taller than has been drawn. Accounting for roof framing, that makes for a low ceiling, but it doesn't yet account for the necessary roof slope and the mechanical units that may appear on top.



Other items

There remains little information on repairs and replacement of existing elements of the buildings. There is a note that the replacement windows are to be simulated divided-light windows to match the existing, but the drawings still show one-over-one windows in 3118, which presently has six-over-six, but the originals were probably six-over-one. This will have to be adequately addressed in the final permit plans.

The drawings also suggest that additional openings would be cut into the south wall of 3118. This should not occur.

Recommendation

HPO recommends that the Board approve the project in concept and delegate to staff further review, in order to address the remaining issues raised above and with the conditions that:

- 1. the side addition shall be added atop a retained brick wing, with its floors aligned with 3118 and its roof further lowered entirely below and not engaging the overhanging eaves;
- 2. the buildings' floor framing shall be retained;
- 3. any permit shall be conditioned upon the roof addition not exceeding the 8'6" height indicated and upon the rooftop mechanical equipment not being seen from 16th Street;
- 4. each building shall have window replacements that closely replicate their original windows, in accordance with the window regulations; and
- 5. new openings shall not be cut into the south wall of 3118 16th Street, and the south chimney shall be retained at least above the south addition.

