HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

(x) Agenda

(x) Addition

(**x**) Alterations

Landmark/District: Mount Pleasant Historic District

Address: 1730 Kenyon Street NW

Meeting Date: October 26, 2017

Case Number: **17-556**

Staff Reviewer: **Tim Dennée** (x) Concept

The applicant, Teass Warren Architects, agent for property owner Dovecot Development LLC, requests conceptual review for a two-story rear addition, rebuilding the front porch, removing the formstone from the façade and make masonry repairs, replacing the windows and the storm door, and reconstructing the lead walk and front fence.

This item was removed from the September consent calendar because of an objection.

Most of the proposed repairs can be reviewed by HPO when more-detailed permit drawings and product information are prepared. The specific needs for masonry repair will be more apparent when the formstone is removed.

The matter that brings the project before the Board is the rear addition which, at sixteen by twenty feet, plus a one-story screened porch, it is larger than HPO is permitted to clear administratively. The addition would be set in about 4'5" from the west property line, creating a court that retains the inset of the second floor of the original rear wing. The structure would be clad in four-inch-exposure fiber-cement lap siding, which has become a typical material for frame rear additions and one the Board has found to be compatible in most similar circumstances. The screened porch would hold a rooftop deck accessed from the second floor.

The addition would require the demolition of the original rear wing. Because that wing is shallow, only about ten feet, and does not extend the width of the lot at the second story, this level of demolition represents a relatively small proportion of the entire historic building. The proposed demolition then does not constitute demolition of the building "in significant part."

This row of eight houses was designed by George Santmyers and constructed in 1922. The rears are mostly intact in that most retain their wings, but the siding and fenestration have often been changed. Two houses, 1724 and 1732 Kenyon, have been altered with one-story additions that retain the upper portion of the wing.

The preservation law expressly balances the strict preservation interest against the interest to adapt properties to current uses. It is not unlikely that other owners would not eventually also seek to expand in the manner of 1724, 1732—or like the present proposal. In nearly all cases,

the rear of a building is the most appropriate location, and possibly the only location to expand. The qualities of these rear wings, although original, are not so compelling that they should be ineligible for alteration or even removal. The voids beside inset portions of upper stories have frequently been filled in on similar houses in Mount Pleasant, both before the establishment of the historic district and after.

Going farther, a two-story addition to a two-story house is typically compatible, if the addition's size does not overwhelm the main block or look too out of place in its context. In this context, it would seem reasonably compatible to allow the rearward extension of this row to approximately the depth of the two-story houses on the adjoining rows (1712-1722 and 1742-1752 Kenyon). As the proposed addition extends a net ten feet, plus another ten feet of one-story porch, it comes about to that point. The court alongside the wing resembles the pattern on those rows.

Recommendation

HPO recommends that the Board approve the concept for the addition as compatible with the character of the historic district and delegate to staff further review with the condition that the formstone be removed from the façade and the façade brick be repaired as necessary.

