
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Property Address:	1415 22nd Street, NW	X	Agenda
Landmark/District:	Codman Carriage House		Consent Calendar
Meeting Date:	November 19, 2015	X	Concept Review
H.P.A. Number:	16-004	X	Alteration
Staff Reviewer:	Steve Callcott		New Construction
			Demolition
			Subdivision

Rock Creek Property Group, with plans prepared by OTJ Architects, seeks conceptual design review for alterations and rehabilitation of the Codman Carriage House, a landmark located in the Dupont Circle Historic District.

Property History and Description

The Codman Carriage House and Stable is a free-standing, two-story brick and stucco building designed and constructed in 1907 by the nationally prominent architect Ogden Codman, Jr. Codman's client was his cousin Martha Codman, a New England heiress who spent the winter social season in Washington; in the year prior, she constructed a lavish mansion on nearby Decatur Place, also designed by her cousin. At the time, the building's location on the edge of Rock Creek Park contained many private and commercial stables and garages, with the new telephone technology making it practical for such facilities (and their associated noises and odors) to be located farther away from primary residences.

While having frontage on 22nd Street, the building's primary elevations face the alleys to the north and south; these elevations contain the original carriage house entry doors, decorative brickwork, large-scale surrounds around the openings, voissoirs, and ashlar patterning. The original appearance of the 22nd Street elevation is not known, and the exterior wall is no longer extant due to the construction of a one-story addition in the 1940s when the building was converted to a tire-sales store and automobile service garage. A rear addition with three garage door bays was added at presumably the same time. Those additions were subsequently altered with the 22nd Street storefront and garage door entrances at the rear blocked up. The building has served as a bar/nightclub for several decades, and is currently vacant.

The building was designated a DC landmark in 1995, and was included in the expanded boundaries of the Dupont Circle Historic District in 2005. Due to its proximity to Rock Creek Park, the property is also subject to review by the US Commission of Fine Arts (CFA).

Proposal

The project calls for rehabilitating the building for office, restaurant or retail use; the applicants will be seeking to market the building to tenants upon receiving conceptual design approval from the HPRB and CFA. Non-original windows would be replaced with wood sash to replicate the original appearances, the original carriage house doors would be replicated on the alley elevations, and the slate roof would be repaired. New window and door openings would be created in the rear

commercial garage addition, and a roof deck with a glass railing would potentially be constructed atop this addition. The front addition would be refaced with a new smooth stucco finish (it would not seek to replicate the pebble dash stucco on the original portion of the building) atop a precast stone base, and new openings created for a central storefront opening and flanking doors. Two versions of the central opening have been developed. Option A calls for a pair of operable garage doors and Option B calls for storefront glazing atop a masonry base; while the glazing in Option B is identified as fixed, it could conceivably also be designed to have some operability if desired. Signage would be located above the doors and/or the large central opening.

Evaluation and Recommendations

While not resulting in full-scale restoration of the building (e.g. removal of the 1940s additions), such an approach is not practical given the lack of information on the original appearance of the 22nd Street elevation and prior loss of that exterior wall; the front addition also serves the useful purpose of providing an at-grade entrance and interior transition to the elevated floor level of the original portion of the building. Nevertheless, the proposal will significantly improve the appearance and street presence of the landmark while also resulting in recreation of missing windows and carriage doors on the original portion of the building. The materials, detailing and proportions of the redesigned front addition are respectful to the landmark while remaining clearly distinct.

Option B is recommended as the more compatible and appropriate of the two options developed. While the garage doors illustrated in Option A might seem at first blush to be appropriate for a historic carriage house, their introduction on the 22nd Street elevation is not consistent with the building's plan or how it functioned, either originally or as reworked in the 1940s, thereby potentially suggesting a false narrative of the building's history. The proportions and overall visual character of the storefront illustrated in Option B is both compatible for the building and more sympathetic to the character of historic commercial building in the Dupont Circle Historic District. If it is determined desirable by the owner or tenant to have the storefront glazing be operable, this should be compatibility accommodated within the general proportions and storefront appearance illustrated in Option B.

Recommendations

The HPO recommends that the Review Board find concept option B consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegate final approval to staff.