# HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

# **Kingman Park Historic District (Case No. 16-19)**

All properties within a boundary formed by East Capitol Street, 19<sup>th</sup> Street, Maryland Avenue and M Street NE and the Anacostia River, including the following squares, parcels and reservations:

Squares 1118, 1119, 1120, 1125, 1126, 1127, 1128, 1134, 1139, 4458, 4459, 4460, 4461, 4462, 4463, 4464, 4477, 4478, 4480, 4481, 4483, 4483E, 4484, 4486, 4495, 4506, 4514, 4515, 4516, 4517, 4518, 4522, 4523, 4525, 4526, 4527, 4528; 4549, 4550, 4558 and 4559; all lots in Parcels 149 and 160; Lot 10 in Parcel 162; and Reservations 343F and 343G

Meeting Date: January 25, 2018

Applicant: Kingman Park Civic Association

Affected ANCs: 5D, 6A and 7D

This report by the Historic Preservation Office (HPO) evaluates the application by the Kingman Park Civic Association (KPCA) to designate a Kingman Park Historic District. It addresses both the substantive proposal and related procedural and planning concerns. First, it analyzes the historical and architectural significance of the proposed historic district under the written criteria for designation used by the Historic Preservation Review Board and the National Register of Historic Places. Secondly, it looks at the proposed boundaries, the period of significance, building integrity, and other issues raised by the nomination. Then it addresses public involvement and planning considerations, and finally, it presents recommendations for the Review Board to consider at its meeting on January 25, 2018.

The report is divided into the following sections:

- Significance of Kingman Park
- Boundary Analysis
- Public Involvement
- Planning Considerations
- Recommendations

#### SIGNIFICANCE OF KINGMAN PARK

The application seeks to designate the Kingman Park Historic District for its significance as a neighborhood built for African Americans during a time of oppressive racial segregation in the District of Columbia and the nation. For decades, Kingman Park's residents strove to develop their own community and prosper as citizens in ways systematically denied them in other parts of the District. In describing the rise of civic and educational amenities that the neighborhood's residents fought to obtain, the application evokes a rich and varied community that struggled and

succeeded in the face of discrimination. Most of the text is devoted to institutions and businesses located within the area, as well as people from all walks of life who lived, worked or studied there. The application also describes government efforts to address the effects of discrimination through the establishment of public facilities in Kingman Park.

Most of Washington's existing historic districts present a different social history, where residents were predominantly white, or both white and black during the established periods of significance, as geographical segregation was not as pronounced until the Jim Crow era. To acknowledge African-American neighborhoods and communities that thrived within that era of formal separation is critical to telling the full story of the District of Columbia and its people. The nomination seeks to achieve that recognition through the proposed district designation.

# **Historical Summary**

The area that became Kingman Park lies just outside the original city of Washington as platted under Pierre L'Enfant's plan. It is situated near the distinctive "notch" at the plan's northeast corner, which was created at the request of prominent landowner Benjamin Stoddert, to exclude a parcel of his land that contained valuable springs. From the time of the city's establishment, a major transportation route, Benning Road, led through the area to Maryland. Leading from Benning Road was an access road, Cool Spring Road (later Oklahoma Avenue) that passed into the city along the eastern edge of the property containing the cool water springs. The Kingman Park subdivisions were ultimately laid out in the area between these two roads.

During the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, the far eastern end of Capitol Hill was only remotely inhabited. City-wide civic improvements, begun in the post-Civil War years, did not extend east of 11<sup>th</sup> Street. Only H Street—the main artery into and out of the city from the east—was cut and paved by 1872 and improved with street car service along the route, with a car barn built at the end of the line at 15<sup>th</sup> and H Streets. Several factors inhibited the area's development: the lack of basic infrastructure (streets, water, gas, and transportation), the unhealthful conditions of the Anacostia Flats, and the undesirable institutions for the sick, poor and criminal on Reservation 13. Beyond certain industrial and nuisance uses, such as an ice manufacturing plant on the site of the Cool Springs, a city dump at the intersection of today's 26<sup>th</sup> Street and Benning Road, and a power plant on Benning Road across the river, the area remained underbuilt into the early 20<sup>th</sup> century.

The wide and extensive Anacostia River marshlands, created by silting from the cultivation of agricultural lands and deforestation upriver, became increasingly polluted as the population of the city increased, and raw sewage carried via trunk lines was deposited directly into the river at its eastern edge. As mosquito breeding grounds along the flats led to high rates of malaria and other diseases, the city and Congress were compelled to address the problem. In 1890, Congress authorized a plan to reclaim the Anacostia River by dredging and filling, and in 1901, the McMillan Plan introduced the idea of creating a lake and recreational facilities to make the area desirable for development. These plans, never fully implemented as conceived, took decades to realize; by 1927, the Army Corps of Engineers had filled the flats about halfway, making progress on an extensive park with a half-mile-long lake named after the head of the Corps, Brigadier General Dan Christie Kingman. These improvements, along with the extension of city infrastructure and the relocation and improvement of facilities on Reservation 13, helped open this area for development during a major period of population growth in the city's history.

## Establishment of Kingman Park

In 1927-28, as development of land east of 14<sup>th</sup> Street, NE, became more attractive, Washington real estate developer Charles Sager began the construction of more than 60 single-family residences along the newly laid streets in the 400 and 500 blocks of 24<sup>th</sup> Street NE. Sager, a white developer who up until then had built housing for white middle-class residents, found his initial rows to be located too far east to attract such buyers at his asking price. Although he did not initially plan to sell his houses to African Americans, Sager quickly found a ready market among middle-class blacks looking to buy. Realizing immediate success, Sager expanded upon his initial plan with the wholesale development of adjacent streets, building several hundred solid, two-story brick rowhouses which he targeted exclusively to "Colored" buyers and which he called "Kingman Park" after the lake being created nearby.

The Kingman Park development offered black workers with steady but modest incomes the opportunity to buy their own homes at a time when other areas of the city were closed to them through racial restrictions. As lots in the subdivisions filled with working and middle-class blacks, other developers and builders capitalized on Sager's real estate success. On the adjacent 25<sup>th</sup> Place, and later Oklahoma Avenue and D Street, builders erected similar rows of solid brick residences which they then sold to African Americans. This tight-knit collection of houses between 21<sup>st</sup> Street and Oklahoma Avenue, south of Benning Road, became a stable residential neighborhood of African-American homeowners and was the nucleus of today's Kingman Park.

## Kingman Park Civic Association

In 1928, Kingman Park's first residents established the Kingman Park Civic Association to address the educational, economic and public safety concerns of the community. While the older East Washington Citizens Association which had formed decades earlier advocated for the "interests of residents living east of the U.S. Capitol," the Kingman Park Civic Association (KPCA), like other emerging civic associations city-wide focused specifically on the needs of the area's African-American residents.

Within its first decades of existence, the civic association had built an active membership, published a monthly newsletter, pushed for construction of educational facilities and street improvements in Kingman Park, and formed a neighborhood cooperative grocery store to serve residents. The historic district nomination describes a history of civic activism continuing in the ensuing decades, and leading to many accomplishments that served the Kingman Park community and protected the character and livability of the neighborhood.

As the residential base and activism of the neighborhood grew, so too did its commercial, educational, religious and community institutions. Churches, a complex of schools, stores, a neighborhood theater (the Langston Theater), a library at Langston Terrace Dwellings, recreational facilities such as Langston Golf Course, emerged to serve the primarily African-American neighborhood.

## Establishment of an Educational Campus

To accommodate families moving into Kingman Park and other northeast neighborhoods, and to fill a longstanding need for more schools for the city's African-American families, the District's Board of Education purchased, in 1931, a 42-acre site north of Benning Road. The Board planned to build "school buildings and playground sites ... new junior high school, etc." for

African-American students. The first school building of the campus, Young Elementary School, opened in October 1931; it would be followed by Browne in 1931-32, and Phelps in 1932-34.

The new schools significantly boosted African-American interest in the area's real estate. During the 1930s, house sales in the Kingman Park and adjacent streets took off, led by working- and middle-class African Americans, many of whom held federal government jobs. At the same time, the campus served as a community meeting and gathering place. Neighborhood children attended the schools, and were free to use the facilities and playgrounds after school hours. Residents of the surrounding neighborhoods had a vested interest in the schools and served as advocates for improvement and quality of education at the campus.

# Langston Terrace Dwellings

In the mid-1930s, as Kingman Park established itself as a stable African-American neighborhood, the federal government embarked upon a plan to build one of the nation's earliest federally funded housing projects for lower-income residents (following three projects in Atlanta and Cleveland, one of which was for black residents). The project was built by the Public Works Administration, established in 1933, and followed the European-influenced public housing design principles developed by the PWA in 1935. The government identified the 85-acre site north of Benning Road, adjacent to the recently finished school complex, to build what became the District's first public housing and one of its most important examples of early architectural modernism.

The 274-unit Langston Terrace Dwellings, designed by African-American architect Hilyard Robinson, was architecturally innovative, with two-story duplexes sited around significant open spaces. Built from 1935 to 1938, it offered African Americans an opportunity to improve their sub-standard living situation and enjoy the benefits of community, modern housing and outdoor space. So well received was the project that federal officials often used it as a demonstration model for the potential of low-rent housing.

# Langston Golf Course

One of the first public amenities planned near the new neighborhood was Langston Golf Course. In 1927, a group of golfers formed the Capital City Golf Club, the nation's first golf club for African Americans, and that same year they wrote to the Department of the Navy requesting that a public facility for African-American golfers be included in the proposed parkland along the Anacostia River. Recent research by the National Park Service indicates that the site for Langston Golf Course was specifically chosen to be in a section of the city that was recognized for its concentrated population of African-American residents. Not only was Kingman Park one of the few areas that had available housing for African Americans, but lacking restrictive covenants, it was also one of few areas that offered single-family homes to black families who could afford home ownership.

The creation of the course as a facility for African Americans was also reinforced by the 1929 National Capital Park and Planning Commission's recreation plan for the city. However, at that time, the selected site had not yet been reclaimed from the Anacostia Flats. Described as a "mosquito infested" dump, the golf course had to await completion of the larger reclamation project by the Army Corps of Engineers—an effort that would take another ten years. It was not until 1938 that the 36-acre tract described in 1927 as a "waste land" was nearing completion as

Langston Golf Course. The parkland-style golf course opened in 1939 with nine holes, all located on the west side of Kingman Lake.

# Spingarn High School

Spingarn High School, already recognized as a separate historic landmark, is another formative institution in the history of Kingman Park. The need for a new high school to serve the African-American residents of the northeastern part of the District was evident as early as the 1930s. Although long envisioned to be part of the education campus, Spingarn High School was not constructed for two more decades, during which time black students traveled across Capitol Hill to Dunbar High School for their education. In 1941, a new senior high school, to be built overlooking Langston Golf Course, was proposed to complete the school campus. The United States' involvement in World War II, however, halted its construction, and the school was not completed until 1952.

# Social History

The Kingman Park nomination lists many accomplished individuals who lived or were educated in the community, or who became engaged with the community through civic events and activities. While such associations may not meet designation criteria of significance for association with any particular persons, the more important conclusion is that *collectively*, many accomplished individuals drew formative life experiences from the neighborhood, and contributed to the social history of their own community or in other public arenas in a way that forms an essential part of the Kingman Park story. This contributes to the significance of the neighborhood under the designation criteria for history.

## **Evaluation Under HPRB and National Register Designation Criteria**

This core area of the proposed Kingman Park Historic District area compellingly illustrates through place a story of imposed segregation, and that of the oppressed coping with and rising above it. In this neighborhood, two contrasting sides of that coin are illustrated in Kingman Park's rowhouses and Langston Terrace's apartments, both of which offered better housing for African Americans, but also testify to how limited such opportunities were.

The original Kingman Park single-family rowhouses constructed during the late 1920s and 1930s form the nucleus of a larger neighborhood that grew over time. A ready market of African American purchasers, too often shut out of fee-simple housing, snapped up these first homes, even when it meant doubling up or renting out a basement. A few years later, the federal government erected Langston Terrace to help address the artificially constrained supply of housing for African American workers within the larger picture of a local market suddenly inadequate to accommodate an expanding federal establishment during the Depression. These two contrasting segments of the neighborhood, one market-based and the other government-provided, reflect a central debate in early-20<sup>th</sup>-century housing policy about which method was better equipped, in the words of Franklin Roosevelt's second inaugural address, to provide for "one-third of a nation ill-housed."

Langston Terrace was cutting-edge in both style and layout, a "separate but equal" attempt to address real hardship in the African American community. Yet, its placement adjacent to the new Kingman Park neighborhood reinforced racial segregation in the area. So too did the creation of other public facilities. The Kingman Park community fought for quality schools, in part to stop

having its children commute so far, but the establishment of the Young-Browne-Phelps-Spingarn campus also suggests how the government ratified geographical segregation by locating schools and recreational facilities in already-black areas as a way of discouraging African-American families from moving elsewhere. As beneficial as they were to the community, the segregated schools and Langston Golf Course continued and even reinforced the de facto racial segregation of neighborhoods in the District of Columbia, perpetuating the fallacy of the "separate but equal" premise.

## Social Achievements and Patterns of History

Kingman Park appears to meet District of Columbia **Criterion B** and National Register **Criterion A** and for history, for "events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history," specifically for an association "with historical periods, social movements, groups, institutions, achievements, or patterns of growth and change that contributed significantly to the heritage, culture or development of the District of Columbia of the nation." Namely, this neighborhood provides an excellent example of a community developed for and nourished by African Americans during the segregation era.

#### Architecture and Urbanism

Kingman Park also appears to meet D.C. Designation **Criterion D** (Architecture and Urbanism) and National Register **Criterion C**, recognizing collections of properties that "embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction." Langston Terrace and the Kingman Park schools have already been shown to meet these criteria through separate listings in the D.C. Inventory and National Register. Many of Kingman Park's rowhouses are not especially distinctive architecturally (as is often the case in historic districts), but as a coherent and distinguishable group they are highly characteristic of the era, notably in the architecturally composed block-long rows marked by front porches and individualizing variations in cornices and rooflines. As a class and a building type, they represent what was available to the middle-and working-class resident, whether black or white, during the second quarter of the twentieth century, and collectively represent a significant and recognizable entity.

#### **BOUNDARY ANALYSIS**

The application's proposed boundaries for the historic district encompass a broad area with several distinct sub-areas. These boundaries are reduced from those initially proposed, which largely followed the present-day jurisdictional boundaries of the Kingman Park Civic Association, extending east to 15<sup>th</sup> Street and north to M Street.

An in-depth staff review of the application and additional research indicates that the proposed boundaries are not entirely consistent with the rationale for the nomination, drawing together multiple areas with differing physical, social and cultural histories. Key sections of the neighborhood within the proposed boundaries are critically linked to the establishment of Kingman Park as an African-American community during the era of segregation, while others are not. Some of these sub-areas developed as white enclaves, or as mixed-race areas that progressively transitioned into African-American ones before becoming part of a larger Kingman Park community.

#### Revised Boundaries

If there is a designation, it is recommended that the boundaries include what was historically the nucleus of Kingman Park. Such boundaries would encompass the major components of the historic community: the original Kingman Park subdivisions and related properties; Langston Terrace Dwellings; the Young, Browne, Phelps and Spingarn educational campus; and Langston Golf Course. This core area best conveys the historic significance of Kingman Park (see map).

Other areas including Rosedale and Isherwood, East Side Park, East Capitol Hill, and Carver Terrace are not recommended for inclusion, as their individual histories and/or physical character are distinct from with the original Kingman Park area, as described below:

#### Rosedale and Isherwood

The development of Rosedale and Isherwood began with the subdivision of rural land in 1876, and the construction of modest, two-story brick and frame residences beginning in the 1890s. These houses, built speculatively on a small scale and at the edge of the developed city, attracted primarily working-class white residents who rented, rather than owned their houses. Rosedale and Isherwood were supported in their first decades of development by their own, whites-only institutions, such as Webb and Blow schools and the Rosedale branch library. Over time, Rosedale and Isherwood became more racially mixed, increasingly black and home to many African-American churches and other institutions.

#### East Side Park

The subdivisions known as East Side Park were initially platted in 1907, but did not develop until 1925-26 when a developer/builder team moved in to build several rows of brick rowhouses. Upon completion, these houses were purchased predominantly by white residents. When the construction of Langston Terrace was planned, 92 white residents of East Side Park signed petitions to the PWA opposing the project, maintaining that Benning Road was intended to be a buffer, with white families living north of Benning, and black families living south. Over time, the area would transition into an African-American neighborhood, but as of 1940, it was still predominantly white.

#### East Capitol Hill

During the 1920s, the reclamation of the Anacostia Flats was well underway, undesirable institutions such as the prison, the workhouse and the almshouse were being relocated, and city streets were being extended and paved into east Capitol Hill. Developers and others investing in real estate began buying up lots and building both small and larger groups of rowhouses. These developers were building to accommodate an intense need of housing, especially for moderate-income buyers. The city blocks between East Capitol and D Streets NE, included in the proposed historic district boundaries, developed along those lines, and from the beginning and throughout its history, attracted both black and white residents.

## World War II Era Housing

Much of the area north of Benning Road consists of large-scale housing developments constructed from 1938 to 1945. Several rows of attached dwellings on either side of 20<sup>th</sup> Street

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Making Modern Homes: A History of Langston Terrace Dwellings, A New Deal Housing Program in Washington, D.C., Kelly Anne Quinn, Ph.D. Dissertation, University of Maryland, 2007 (HPO files).

NE north of H Street, built before America's entry into World War II in 1941, are more architecturally comparable to those of Kingman Park, but were separated physically from them by the white enclave of the East Side Park subdivisions. Carver Terrace, a compound of dozens of three-story garden-apartment-type buildings with hundreds of units, largely defines the area north of Langston Terrace Dwellings. Built in 1945-50 by developer Preston Wire, Carver Terrace was one of the largest privately owned and operated housing developments for African Americans in the country. These postwar buildings are distinct from Kingman Park in both historical origins and architectural character.

## *Integrity and Historical Perspective*

The recommended area of Kingman Park meets the test of integrity that is required for listing in the D.C. Inventory and National Register. Properties must possess sufficient integrity to convey, represent or contain the values and qualities for which they are judged significant. With a proposed period of significance from 1928 to 1968, it also meets the requirement for sufficient passage of time to permit professional evaluation in its historical context.

# Contributing and Non-Contributing Properties

Buildings that are constructed within the defined period of significance and maintain integrity would contribute to the character of the historic district, and would be considered "contributing" resources. Buildings constructed outside the period of significance, or that no longer retain physical integrity would not contribute to the character of the district, and would be considered "non-contributing."

Overall, Kingman Park exhibits a high degree of integrity, and nearly all of the buildings within the boundaries proposed would be considered contributing. Based on a preliminary analysis, several buildings along Benning Road would be non-contributing because they post-date the period of significance. These include the Verizon facility at 580 23<sup>rd</sup> Place, Hip Hop Fish & Chicken restaurant at 2301 Benning Road, the one-story commercial building at 2305 Benning Road, the 7-Eleven at 2501 Benning Road, the Exxon station at 2539 Benning Road, and the DC Streetcar Car Barn Training Center at 26<sup>th</sup> and Benning Road. Two buildings, 2417 Benning Road and 400 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NE would be considered non-contributing for lack of sufficient integrity. The building at 2417 Benning Road has been altered significantly by the removal of its porch and original roof, alterations to its windows, and the addition of a rooftop addition that is not compatible with the historic character of the building. The building at 400 21<sup>st</sup> Street has been significantly altered by a rear addition, a carved-out ground level, new windows and other alterations, but still retains its historic massing that is consistent with the streetscape.

## PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT

KPCA first submitted this unsolicited nomination to the Historic Preservation Office on January 1, 2016. After an initial review, HPO staff met with KPCA to give technical advice about the nomination and guidance on the process of seeking designation. Over the following months, HPO staff assisted the applicants in supplementing the nomination with additional information needed to meet minimum filing requirements. The staff advised KPCA of the expectation that they would conduct significant community outreach within the area affected by the proposal, and recommended they consider reducing the boundaries of the proposed district. KPCA submitted a revised application with reduced boundaries in August 2016, along with the filing fee.

#### Public Notice

After filing the application in August 2016, HPO gave public notice in the D.C. Register and to the affected Advisory Neighborhood Commissions. The HPO staff encouraged KPCA to continue public involvement and seek support from the affected ANCs.

In the summer of 2017, KPCA requested a hearing on the nomination, and in August 2017, HPO gave public notice, with letters mailed to each property owner, for a hearing on October 26, 2017. When this was postponed, HPO re-issued notice of case in November 2017, again with letters to each property owner, for a hearing on January 25, 2018.

## Public Meetings

Since filing the application, HPO staff have attended the following public meetings to answer questions about the proposed designation process and review procedures for historic districts under the preservation law:

- November 17, 2016, sponsored by the Friends of Kingman Park;
- March 11, 2017, sponsored by the Friends of Kingman Park;
- October 27, 2017, sponsored by ANC 5D05;
- November 18, 2017, sponsored by the Office of Planning; and
- December 5, 2017, sponsored by the Langston Civic Association.

KPCA has been advised to address its public outreach efforts in its presentation of the application to the Board.

## ANC Recommendations

Advisory Neighborhood Commissions 6A and 7D have submitted comments on the application to HPRB. ANC 6A voted on April 14, 2017 to oppose the district with the boundaries described in the application. The ANC recommended against the inclusion of residents in the portion of 6A included within the boundaries, citing limited communication and outreach, lack of transparency in the process, and stating that affected residents felt they do not know enough about the proposed historic designation and preferred to be left out of it at this time.

ANC 7D submitted a letter on December 13, 2017, stating that the ANC did not take a position on the proposed designation. The letter states that the Applicants did not provide the Commission with information necessary to make a determination. The ANC also cites the applicant's lack of documented public outreach, failure to provide an updated application, and substantial community opposition, among other factors.

#### **Public Comments**

As of January 10, 2018, the Board has received several hundred communications on the proposed designation, in the form of individualized and form letters, petitions, and electronic survey results. Comments have come from government officials, organizations, and District residents within and outside KPCA's proposed historic district boundaries, as well as residents of Maryland and other jurisdictions. Many of the letters from non-District residents come from those who were former residents of Kingman Park or former students at the Kingman Park

schools. All public comments received by 3:00 pm on January 24 will be distributed to the Board members before the January 25 hearing.

Among the reasons expressed by those in support of a historic district are that designation would recognize and preserve the cultural history of Kingman Park as an African-American community, and acknowledge the significance of many notable individuals associated with the neighborhood. Also cited are the important landmarks within Kingman Park, and the importance of preserving the quality of its architecture. Some supporters expressed concern about the impact of "pop-ups" and inappropriate renovations on the character of the neighborhood.

Among the reasons expressed by those in opposition are that historic designation would increase property values, resulting in higher property taxes, pricing out seniors and lower-income residents. The cost and difficulty of renovating property in an historic district is cited as a reason for opposition, particularly for growing families. The Benning Road corridor is also cited as an area with high potential for redevelopment and some questioned whether historic designation would deter potential investors and businesses.

#### PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

## **Comprehensive Plan Guidance**

Designation of a Kingman Park Historic District would be consistent with policies in the D.C. Comprehensive Plan, provided there is full participation by Advisory Neighborhood Commissions and careful consideration of public views. Pertinent policies and recommended actions include the following from the Historic Preservation Element:

## Policy HP-1.1.2: Defining Significance Broadly

Adopt an encompassing approach to historic significance. Recognize the city's social history as well as its architectural history, its neighborhoods as well as its individual buildings, its natural landscape as well as its built environment, its characteristic as well as its exceptional, and its archaeology as well as its living history. 1003.6

## Policy HP-1.1.3: Cultural Inclusiveness

Celebrate a diversity of histories, tracing the many roots of our city and the many cultures that have shaped its development. A multitude of citizens both famous and ordinary wrote its history. Historic preservation should bear witness to the contributions of all these people. 1003.7

## Policy HP-1.3.1: Designation of Historic Properties

Recognize and protect significant historic properties through official designation as historic landmarks and districts under both District and federal law, maintaining consistency between District and federal listings whenever possible. 1005.6

## Policy HP-1.3.3: Leadership in Designation

Systematically evaluate and nominate significant District-owned properties for historic designation. Encourage, assist, or undertake the nomination of privately owned properties

as appropriate in consultation with owners, Advisory Neighborhood Commissions, and community groups. 1005.8

## Policy HP-1.3.4: Historic District Designation

Use historic district designations as the means to recognize and preserve areas whose significance lies primarily in the character of the community as a whole, rather than in the separate distinction of individual structures. Ensure that the designation of historic districts involves a community process with full participation by affected Advisory Neighborhood Commissions, neighborhood organizations, property owners, businesses, and residents. 1005.9

# Policy HP-1.3.5: Consulting the Public on Designations

Ensure that the views of property owners, Advisory Neighborhood Commissions, neighborhood organizations, and the general public are solicited and given careful consideration in the designation process. 1005.10

Pertinent policies and recommended actions for the Capitol Hill Planning Area, which includes Kingman Park south of Benning Road, include:

## Policy CH-1.1.1: Conserving Residential Uses

Maintain the integrity and quality of Capitol Hill's residential uses, and recognize the importance of its historic architecture and housing stock to the entire District of Columbia. Ensure that Comprehensive Plan and zoning designations for Capitol Hill neighborhoods sustain its moderate density land use pattern. 1508.2

## Policy CH-1.1.2: Renovation of Housing Stock

Encourage the rehabilitation and renovation of the building stock throughout the Capitol Hill Planning Area, taking steps to preserve and restore important historic features. Where infill development occurs, its scale and character should be compatible with prevailing neighborhood densities and its design should contribute to neighborhood continuity and quality. 1508.3

# Policy CH-1.1.3: Upgrading Commercial Districts

Reinforce and upgrade the major commercial districts of Capitol Hill, including the H Street and Benning Road corridors, the Pennsylvania Avenue corridor, 7th and 8th Streets SE, and Massachusetts Avenue between Union Station and Stanton Park. Support the further development of these areas with local-serving retail services, provided that such uses are compatible with surrounding land uses and the historic architecture and scale of the shopping districts themselves. Support the retention of existing neighborhood-serving businesses in these areas through programs that provide technical and financial assistance to small, locally-owned establishments. 1508.4

# Policy CH-1.1.4: Directing Growth

Direct growth in the Capitol Hill Planning Area to commercially zoned land, with a particular emphasis on the H Street/Benning Road corridor. Mixed use development combining ground floor retail and upper story residential uses should be supported in this area, along with streetscape improvements that improve visual and urban design qualities

and enhance pedestrian, bus, and auto circulation. As in all parts of the city, the scale of development must be sensitive to adjacent uses and should reflect the capacity of roads, infrastructure, and services to absorb additional growth. 1508.5

# Action CH-1.1.A: Façade Improvements

Support urban design and façade improvements along H Street, Benning Road, Pennsylvania Avenue, and Barracks Row. Such improvements should preserve and enhance the historic features, scale, and texture of existing structures. 1508.17

## Policy CH-1.2.2: Implementation of Preservation Programs

Solicit additional community input on historic preservation needs and opportunities in the Capitol Hill Planning Area, including the surveying of additional areas, expansion of existing historic districts, and increasing the number of landmarked buildings in the city's current inventory. The HPO should concentrate its efforts in the areas north and east of the Capitol Hill Historic District, and should seek to protect structures along H Street and in other areas that are not currently protected under the District's preservation law. Historic district laws and guidelines should be strictly monitored and enforced for all new construction, alterations, and public space uses. 1509.2

## Action CH-1.2.A: Historic Surveys

Conduct historic surveys for the portion of Stanton Park not currently in the Capitol Hill Historic District, and for the Near Northeast, Hill East, Rosedale, and Kingman Park neighborhoods. Based on the findings of those surveys and additional community input and recommendations, prepare nominations to the National Register as appropriate. Consideration should be given to extending the Capitol Hill Historic District eastward to the boundary of the 1791 L'Enfant Plan. 1509.9

Pertinent policies and recommended actions for the Capitol Hill Planning Area, which includes Kingman Park north of Benning Road, include:

## Policy UNE-1.2.2: Protecting Local Historic Resources

Protect historic resources in Upper Northeast, including Gallaudet University, the Brooks Mansion, Crummell School, the homes of Ralph Bunche and Samuel Gompers, the Franciscan Monastery, Langston Terrace housing project, Langston Golf Course, the Hospital for Sick Children, Glenwood Cemetery, and the Fort Circle Parks. 2409.2

## Policy UNE-2.2.4: Langston and Carver Terrace

Sustain the Langston Terrace and Carver Terrace developments as essential housing resources for lower income families. Important historic elements of Langston Terrace should be protected and restored. 2412.8

## **Zoning**

Zoning for the proposed historic district is RF-1 for the rowhouse blocks south of Benning Road, MU-4 for the properties fronting Benning Road, and RA-2 for the Langston Terrace Dwellings. The school campuses and Langston Golf Course are unzoned.

The RF-1 zone is for areas predominantly developed with attached row houses on small lots within which no more than 2 dwelling units are permitted. The maximum allowed height is 35 feet, with 60% lot occupancy for attached and semi-attached dwellings.

The MU-4 zone is intended to permit moderate-density mixed-use development, with facilities for shopping and business needs, housing, and mixed uses in low- and moderate-density residential areas. The maximum allowed height is 50 feet, with 60% lot occupancy and 2.5 FAR (75% occupancy and 3.0 FAR with Inclusionary Zoning).

The RA-2 zone is for areas developed with predominantly moderate-density residential. The maximum allowed height is 50 feet, with 60% lot occupancy and 1.8 FAR.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon a review of the application and other relevant documentation, and after conducting additional research, the Historic Preservation Office finds that a portion of the area proposed for designation as a Kingman Park Historic District appears to meet the criteria of significance for listing in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and the National Register of Historic Places.

HPO recommends that the Board proceed to hear the applicant's presentation of the case and public testimony at its meeting on January 25, 2018. However, given the recommendations of the affected Advisory Neighborhood Commissions, questions raised in public comments, and limitations in the National Register nomination document prepared by the applicant, HPO also recommends that the Board defer action on the nomination to allow additional time to address these issues.

Specifically, HPO recommends that the Board:

- 1) Make a preliminary finding that the proposed historic district, with the reduced boundaries described within this report, appears to meet the DC Inventory and National Register designation criteria;
- 2) Acknowledge the many public comments on the proposed nomination, including the comments from the Advisory Neighborhood Commissions and the public comments in support and opposition;
- 3) Direct HPO to revise the National Register nomination form to:
  - Supplement documentation of the physical and social development of Kingman Park, including the construction history and community efforts to secure better housing, schools and other institutions;
  - Revise the boundaries of the proposed district as recommended in this report;
  - Provide more discussion on the building history, development and architecture;
  - Conduct any research necessary to evaluate and refine the period of significance; and
  - Prepare a list of contributing and non-contributing properties based on a survey of the age and integrity of each;

- 4) Request HPO to draft design guidelines that would establish preservation and design principles for building alterations and additions, to provide clarity and transparency about the practical implications of designation;
- 5) Encourage HPO and the applicant to continue a dialogue with affected ANCs, aimed at ensuring they have sufficient information to evaluate the application and its implications; and
- 6) Resume the hearing on its regularly scheduled meeting date of March 22, 2018, to give further direction on how the Board wishes to proceed.