

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
April 26, 2012 and May 3, 2012

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on April 26, 2012.

Present: Catherine Buell, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Gretchen Pfaehler, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Joseph Taylor.

APRIL 26TH AGENDA

HISTORIC LANDMARK (*CONTINUATION OF MARCH 22 MEETING*)

First Church of Christ, Scientist, 1770 Euclid Street, NW (*pending landmark*), HPA #12-209, revised concept/nine-story rear addition for hotel.

The Board heard additional testimony and continued the case to the May 24th meeting.

ST. ELIZABETHS EAST CAMPUS

Master plan and design guidelines for Saint Elizabeths East Campus, 2700 Martin Luther King, Jr. Avenue, SE.

The Board offered the following comments on the plan and guidelines: The siting and size of the new construction does not address the edge of the campus as well as it might; it could present a visual barrier to the surrounding neighborhoods and not integrate with them well. They should relate well to Martin Luther King and Alabama Avenues. There should be more variation of massing and density along the avenue than is indicated by the illustrative drawings. In general, the new construction suggested by the guidelines and illustrative drawings seems too uniform and distinct from the historic patterns (comparisons were made to a “suburban office park” and to M Street SE/SW), although this is more evident in the illustrations, which do not necessarily reflect the possibilities available within the guidelines. The plan will naturally change with implementation, and build-out ought to reflect an organic evolution over time, with buildings speaking to their own time, as well as to each other and the historic patterns of development. The Board emphasized the need for flexibility, as well as the importance of observing the compatibility standard in the historic preservation law.

The Board recognized that new roads and widened and straightened existing roads will have adverse effects on the campus setting, and the roads connecting the two principal spines should be looked at for additional narrowing because they are too close to the buildings. The most specific concern about width was expressed relative to the extension of Cypress Street, and the suggestion was made to eliminate curbside parking there. But such refinements can be achieved through further development of the roadway plan in accordance with the stipulations of the draft memorandum of agreement (MOA).

The Board supported the idea of interpretive markers, which will be erected in accordance with the transportation MOA, and encouraged the retention of the 1957 chapel as an important community meeting space and a visual landmark. The Board also indicated its comfort with the idea of delegating to staff the review of the moving of structures discussed in the plan and staff report.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

7th and Pennsylvania Avenue, SE, HPA #11-195, revised concept/redevelopment of Hine Junior High School site.

The Review Board found the revisions to improve the compatibility of the conceptual plan and to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. Any substantial changes should return to the Board for further review. Vote: 5-3 (Pfaehler, Sonderman, and Davidson opposed; Metzger recused).

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

330 7th Street, NE, HPA #12-303, rear addition to Northeast Library.

The Board approved the concept as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegated final approval to staff, with the condition that the exterior design concerns expressed in the staff report be addressed. Vote: 9-0

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

7222 Blair Road NW, HPA #12-119, new curb cut and driveway.

Case deferred to May 24th meeting.

LANDMARK HEARING

Bunker Hill Elementary School, 1401 Michigan Avenue, NE, Case #11-20.

The Board designated the Bunker Hill Elementary School, 1401 Michigan Avenue, NE, a landmark to be entered in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites, and that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places with a positive recommendation for listing as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1939 to 1953. Vote: 8-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The HPRB approved the following items on the consent calendar:

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3509 Macomb Street NW, HPA #12-308, concept/rear addition.

(Casarella recused)

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1777 Church Street, NW, HPA #12-304, concept/rear addition.

14TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1328 14th Street, NW, HPA #12-32, revised concept/new construction, six-story apartment building.

(Buell opposed)

GEORGETOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

1609 34th Street, NW, HPA #12-237, concept/second-story rear addition.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1425 Swann Street, NW, HPA #12-259, concept/new construction of rowhouse.

2223 13th Street, NW, HPA #12-246, concept/rear addition.

MAY 3RD AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on May 3, 2012.

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Acting Chair; Andrew Aurbach, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Joseph Taylor. Absent: Catherine Buell, Maria Casarella, and Rauzia Ally.

DESIGN GUIDELINES

Utility Meters on Historic Property, consideration of final draft.

The Board approved the guideline. Vote: 6-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Christian Science Monitor Building, 900 16th Street, NW, HPA #12-035, concept/new building to replace an existing office building.

The case was deferred at the request of the applicants to the May 24th meeting.

MARJORIE WEBSTER CAMPUS HISTORIC DISTRICT

1640 Kalmia Road, NW, HPA #12-200, concept/alterations and addition.

The Review Board found the conceptual design to be compatible with the character of the historic district and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 6-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Carnegie Geophysical Institute (Levine School of Music), 2801 Upton Street, NW, HPA #12-302, concept/window replacement.

The Board approved the proposed window replacements as submitted and delegated final construction permit approval to staff. Vote: 6-0.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1742 Church Street, NW, HPA #12-280, concept/side addition.

The Board found the general concept for a side addition to be compatible with the character of the historic district and offered the following comments: The existing front entrance doors should be retained, while the option of using the space for the location of sign boxes / advertisements for the theatre should be explored. The setback of the proposed side yard addition should be restudied in order to allow for the greater preservation of the view and historic fabric of the articulated side (east) elevation. The size of the proposed side yard addition should be restudied in order to allow for it to be prominent and clearly legible from the street. The design of the proposed side yard addition should be restudied in order to simply it, with attention paid to looking at alternatives to the proposed undulating colored/opaque glass panels. The board stated that the applicant should return with a revised design that addresses these concerns at a future meeting. Vote: 4-2 (Taylor and Aurbach opposed).

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

2001 Martin Luther King Jr. Avenue, SE, HPA #12-266, construction of one-story modular office building.

The Board recommended approval of the concept with the conditions that: the parking spaces be located along the alley and not the side street; that any gate in the façade be a solid door compatible with the building and the historic district; that the stucco be of a color consistent with the masonry of the historic district and that the applicant consider a masonry base or water table for practical reasons; and that the

building would preferably abut the right of way, but if set back to create planting strips, these areas have low plantings. **Vote: 6-0.**

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

460-462 Ridge Street, NW, #12-210, concept/new three-and-one-half-story residence and third-floor addition.

The Board found the concept for a two-story building with a visible setback third floor at 460-462 Ridge Street NW to be incompatible with the character of the historic district and therefore not consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. Vote: 5-0.

BLAGDEN ALLEY/SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICTS

903 N Street, NW, HPA #12-306, façade alterations.

The Board found the permit application for front façade alterations to be compatible with the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, but that approval for the exterior trash storage container be contingent on the development of a public space improvement and landscape plan. Vote: 6-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Pine Crest Manor (Greystone Enclave), 2323 Porter Street NW, HPA #12-307, concept/rear addition.

The case was deferred at the request of the applicant.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website and accessible through the following abbreviated URL: <http://tinyurl.com/c7585vm>