GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS November 20 and December 4, 2014

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on November 20 and December 4, 2014.

NOVEMBER 20 MEETING

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, Joseph Taylor, and Charles Wilson.

HISTORIC DESIGNATION HEARING

Rock Creek Valley Historic District, federal Reservations 308A, 356, 339, 402, 432, 433, 545, 563, 630 and 635, Case 14-19.

The Historic Preservation Review Board heard the nomination and testimony for the amendment to the Rock Creek Valley Historic District. The Board approved, in concept, the listing of the amended nomination in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites and the forwarding of the nomination by the NPS to the National Register. However, based upon the testimony, the Board voted to hold the case open for an indeterminate period of time to allow the HPO and NR to conduct additional outreach, particularly to the affected ANCs. The case will be brought back to the Board after such outreach is completed, likely in the spring of 2015 for a vote. Vote: 8-0

HISTORIC DESIGNATION HEARING

Blanche Kelso Bruce School, 770 Kenyon Street NW, Case 13-2

The Board designated the school a landmark to be entered in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites and requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places with a recommendation for listing as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1898 to 1927. The Board requested that the nomination be revised to add more information about the latest, non-historic wing and about the site, its topography, and lost features such as the original entry stair. Vote: 8-0 (Ally absent).

HISTORIC DESIGNATION HEARING

James Ormond Wilson Normal School, 1100 Harvard Street NW, Case 13-20.

The Board designated the school a landmark to be entered in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites and requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places with a recommendation for listing as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1912 to 1987. The Board recommended that the nomination be revised to include more description and analysis of the building and its site (particularly the roofline, windows, topography and landscape). Vote: 8-0 (Ally absent).

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1815 Lamont Street NW, HPA 15-004 Lamont Street NW, three-story rear addition and roof decks.

The Board recommended that the concept be revised to reduce the size of the exterior stair and the one-story addition and to remove the deck from the principal roof. Vote: 7-1 (Taylor against).

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

3146 16th Street NW, HPA 11-345, design development of demolition of rear of church, construction of residential additions, alterations.

The Board recommended approval of the project with further review delegated to staff. The Board specified a preference for use of the ivory brick; stated that the gate entrance should be more prominent, perhaps integrating some element(s) of the signage; asked for simplified window headers and more careful and accurate window frame and brick mold details and fitting the windows to the brick coursing; requested that the flashing of the church parapet be done with lead strips at the joints rather than continuous flashing; and asked that all aspects of the exterior lighting, the railings, and the cleaning, patching or other treatment of the stone be worked through with staff. Vote: 9-0.

14th Street Historic District

1618 14th Street NW, HPA 15-064, demolition [Deferred at request of ANC 2F]

HISTORIC LANDMARK/DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1600 21st Street NW (Phillips Collection), HPA 15-054, rooftop mechanical penthouse enclosure. The Board approved the conceptual proposal for a mansard roof form to serve as roof top screening of mechanical equipment as a compatible solution. The materials and detailing of the roof should relate to the original portion of the building (rather than the 1980s wing), and the applicants should discuss with staff mitigation and interpretation of the property's evolution for the public. The project should return to the Board for final approval when ready. Vote: 6-0 (Taylor recused).

HISTORIC LANDMARK/SHERIDAN KALORAMA HISTORIC DISTRICT

2111 Florida Avenue NW (Friends Meeting House), HPA 14-529, revised concept/addition. The Board found the applicant's proposal to clad the elevator tower in stone to match the meeting house to be compatible in concept, and asked that the project be further developed and detailed and return to the Board for final approval when ready. Vote: 7-0.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1508 Caroline Street NW, HPA 15-058, concept/mansard roof and rear addition.

The Board found the concept for a third floor addition to be incompatible with the historic district, and found the concept plans for a two-story rear addition, one-story side addition, and basement entrance to be compatible and delegated final review to staff. Vote: 4-3.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1202 T Street, NW, HPA 14-701, concept/new construction, three-story rowhouse. The Board found the concept compatible with historic district, but requested revisions to the front bay and more information on the stair tower, delegating final review to staff. Vote: 8-0.

BLAGDEN ALLEY/NAYLOR COURT HISTORIC DISTRICT

925 M Street NW, HPA 14-716, concept/new construction, three-story rowhouse. The Board found the concept for a 3-story brick and metal rowhouse at 925 M Street NW to be generally compatible with the character of the historic district, on the condition that the extent of glazing within the bay be restudied, the front areaway be reduced, and return to the Board. Vote: 7-0 (Sonderman absent).

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

3428, 3430 and 3432 Oakwood Terrace NW, HPA #13-335, revised concept/construction of two flats. The Board supported roughly the dimensions of the building, but acknowledged that the exact site plan would likely change because of revisions to the building footprint and driveway. The Board requested further revision to establish proportions, rhythm, massing and materials of the building and proportions and rhythm of fenestration more compatible with the character of the historic district. Vote: 8-0 (Sonderman absent).

DECEMBER 4 MEETING

Present: Gretchen Pfaehler (Chair), Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor, and Charles Wilson. Absent: Robert Sonderman.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

900 11th Street SE, HPA 14-527, concept/new construction.

The Board found the concept to be compatible with the Capitol Hill historic district and directed the applicants to refine the design to set the penthouse back from the south edge of the building, rethink the use of a large bay at the corner, and remove the areaways from the bay on the 11th Street side. The Board asked the applicant to return for review of the revised plans. Vote: 7-0

21-7th-Street NE, HPA 15-152, concept/rear alterations-[deferred at the request of the owner]

645 Maryland Ave NE, HPA 15-065, concept/ rear and roof addition.

The Board found that the concept of an addition has the potential to be compatible with the Capitol Hill Historic District but that as proposed the dimensions and proportions are not compatible. Vote: 7-0-1

609 Maryland Ave NE, HPA 15-153, concept/window replacement.

The Board found the concept of some selective replacement of stained glass with vision glass to be consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and directed the applicant to restudy the extent of removal to reduce the total amount of glass to be replaced. The project should return to the Board for further review when the interior plans are ready. Vote: 8-0

FOGGY BOTTOM HISTORIC DISTRICT

2431 I Street NW, HPA 14-625, concept/three-story rear addition to two-story rowhouse.

The Board found the concept to add a partial third story to be incompatible with the character of the historic district but supported the idea of an addition similar to that proposed, but at the height of two stories, with the conditions that its cladding be true stucco and that the façade's replacement windows be appropriate two-over-twos. Vote: 7-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARK [PENDING]

Scheele-Brown House, 2207 Foxhall Road NW, HPA 15-066, concept/demolish porch and bathroom additions and relocate house.

The Board found the conceptual plan for relocation to be compatible, except for the walk across the front yard, with additional attention to providing a proper landscape setting for the house and to some interpretation of its history. Vote: 7-1 (Taylor against).

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1600-1602 7th Street NW, HPA 14-714, concept/rear addition to row building and pavilion on vacant site.

The Board found the general concept of adding a three-story addition to the rear of the building acceptable, but that significant redesign was needed for both the rear addition and platform element for them to be compatible with the historic district; the rehabilitation scope of work also needed to be further developed. The project should return to the Board when appropriate. Vote: 7-0.

DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

610-624 Eye Street NW, HPA 14-242, revised concept, addition/new construction.

The Board found that for the project to be compatible with the historic district it would need to have a much smaller bridge over the north/south alley -2-3 floors at most, or no bridge at all -- and with no construction over the alley buildings. The concept for the Eye Street streetscape, alley scape, and green roofs on the historic buildings were commended and found compatible. The architecture of the new construction should be revised to be more in scale with the proportions and geometries of the Eye Street buildings, and the penthouse should be fully incorporated into the building's design. Vote: 7-0.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on November 20 by a vote of 8-0 (Wilson absent).

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

750 9th Street SE, HPA 15-049, concept/new rear accessory building.

GEORGETOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

3107 N Street NW, HPA 15-037, concept/replace two-story rear addition with larger addition.

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1222 11th Street NW, HPA 15-060, concept/addition, setback story on top of a three-story rowhouse.

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

6918 Willow and 6925 Maple Street NW, HPA 15-062 (continuation of HPA 06-448, 449 and 450); revised concept/construction of two three-story apartment buildings.

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, <u>www.olenderreporting.com,or info@OlenderReporting.com</u>. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <u>http://planning.dc.gov</u>