GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS April 25 and May 2, 2013

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on April 25, 2013. Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor, and Charles Wilson.

APRIL 25TH AGENDA

MCMILLAN PARK RESERVOIR

McMillan Reservoir Sand Filtration Site; discussion of revised master plan and design guidelines (continuation of March 28 meeting).

The Board expressed its appreciation for the hard work and substantial efforts of the VMP team and the community in working to improve the proposal, and found the revised master plan to be an improvement over the previous submission, particularly with retaining the raised berm/plinth condition at the south end of the site. The Board encouraged that the original tripartite organization be strengthened, such as by eliminating new secondary roads and encouraging a more cohesive site plan in the middle section. The Board continued to question the external orientation of the buildings and garden in the northern portion of the site, and the effect the new construction will have on the north maintenance corridor. While appreciative of the larger public park and preservation of open space in the southern portion, the plans for the park itself should be developed to maintain a strong sense of the site's open quality. As well, it was noted that the larger park had resulted in the new construction "ballooning out" elsewhere on the site, resulting in the loss of the Olmsted perimeter walk, which was felt to be an important element to retain and to unify the disparate new construction projects. To justify the extent of demolition and to ensure some sense of place be retained, the Board thought that the quality of new construction will need to be extremely high, and that the guidelines for new construction were perhaps not strong enough to ensure unity and cohesiveness among the various new buildings.

LANDMARK DESIGNATION HEARINGS

Brigadier General George P. Scriven House, 1300 New Hampshire Avenue NW, Case #12-04. The Board designated the property a historic landmark to be entered in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites, and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places with a recommendation for listing as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1893 to 1918. Vote: 8-1 (Casarella opposed).

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1216 18th Street NW, HPA #13-212, concept/rear roof deck and screening of mechanical equipment. The Board found the concept design for the addition to be compatible with the existing historic building and encouraged the architect to continue to develop the elevations and details to include a separation between the historic building and new construction through detailing, and to restudy 2nd floor louver and screen detail; include missing drawings of the west elevation; and requested to see the project in May for review. Vote: 9-0

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Uline Arena & Icehouse (Washington Coliseum), 1140 3rd Street, NE, HPA #160, concept/alterations, roof additions.

The HPRB found the conceptual design to be generally consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, with the additional study and consideration given to the following: (1) Fenestration within the coliseum to better retain the pattern of fenestration on the M Street elevation and to ensure new windows are compatible with the building; (2) Design of the roof addition on the icehouse, particularly on the portion that wraps around to M Street, to improve its relationship with the underlying building; (3) Consideration of how the interior volume of the building might be retained in some portion of the coliseum; (4) On-site interpretation of the site's significance should be developed as an integral part of the building's design; 5) the parking garage and streetscape treatment should continue to be developed in consultation with the community. Vote: 9-0.

DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

819 6th Street, NW, HPA #12-492, concept/five-story rear addition.

The Board found the concept for a five story rear addition to be compatible with the character of the historic building and its context within the Downtown Historic District, contingent on the location for mechanical equipment and utility meters being placed unobtrusively and detailing related to the addition being further refined, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 9-0.

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2012-2014 Kalorama Road NW, HPA#13-164, revised concept/alterations, rear addition.

The Board found the revised concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the preservation act conditioned on a reduction of the perceived mass of the 4th floor, refinements to relay a more residential scale, and continued coordination with the community. The Board directed the applicant to return for permit review. HPRB approval shall not be construed as endorsement for any necessary zoning or building code relief. Vote: 9-0.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNING

Public comments on 2016 Historic Preservation Plan (Draft).

Public comments on the preservation plan were heard; no formal action was requested or taken by the HPRB.

MAY 2ND AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on May 2, 2013. Present: Gretchen Pfaehler, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, and Charles Wilson. Absent: Maria Casarella, Bob Sonderman and Joseph Taylor.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Hecht Company Warehouse, 1401 New York Avenue, NE, HPA #13-065, revised concept/adjacent construction of garage.

The Board found the revised garage and streetscape concept plans to be compatible with the landmark and consistent with the preservation act. It was recommended that that the applicants continue to study the corner tower elements on New York Avenue, either eliminating them entirely or making them more subtle, that the precast trim elements be made thinner in profile, that the color and material of the sidewalks be consistent with the character and period of the landmark, and that the glazed brick from the demolished 1961 wing of the building be considered for reuse. Motion to approve the concept and delegate final approval to staff approved. Vote: 5-0 (Ally not present)

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1216-1226 9th Street NW, HPA #13-215, concept/rear additions.

The Board approved the concept for a three-story rear addition at 1216, 1218 and 1226 9th Street NW, including the joining of the lots in to a single lot, and delegated final approval to staff. Vote: 5-0 (Ally not present).

1620 7th Street NW, HPA #13-206, concept/new 3-story commercial/residential building.

The Board found the concept for a new three-story rear building at 1620 7th Street NW to be compatible with the character of the Shaw Historic District and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 6-0.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2123 Twining Court, NW, HPA #13-210, concept for alteration with roof deck.

The Board found the scope of exterior restoration and one-story garage addition consistent with the purposes of the preservation act; encouraged the applicants to develop a variation of Option C (with the roof deck on the north side of the building) that pulls the proposed roof deck further in from the sides and pulled back from the outside wall to minimize the projecting handrail; and encouraged the applicant to study the detailing of the garage addition and handrails. The applicant is to work with staff in resolving these design issues. Vote: 5-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

420-430 3rd Street, NE and 208, 214, and 236 Massachusetts Avenue, NE, HPA #13-107, revised concept/new construction and site alterations.

The Board approved final detailing and materials for new construction on 3rd Street. The Board also approved the applicants' original (February 2013) concept plan for a new sidewalk café on 3rd Street. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 4-2.

720 L Street, SE, HPA #13-267, concept/site alterations for beer garden.

The Board recommended restudy of the service structure on the lot to improve its compatibility with the historic district, with the project returning to the Board for further review when ready. The applicants will work with staff on final details for trellises, fencing, signage, retaining walls, ramps and stairs, and any dumpster enclosure. Vote: 3-2 (Metzger recused).

1113 Pennsylvania Avenue, SE, HPA #13-258, concept/side addition.

The Board found the concept to be compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, and final approval was delegated to staff with the following conditions: the applicant will work with staff on the roof access structure design and the blocking up of the secondary elevation windows. Vote: 6-0.

SPINGARN HIGH SCHOOL

Spingarn High School, 2500 Benning Road, NE, HPA #13-004, refinements to approved concept for proposed streetcar car barn.

The Board unanimously approved the site development-related aspects of the concept including the siting of facility the total number and placement of tracks and parking spaces and related details. The Board also endorsed the "stay arm" system for overhead wires within the project area and urged DDOT to minimize the visual impacts of the catenary system as a whole. Finally, the Board encouraged DDOT to communicate carefully with the ANC and the larger community regarding how and when the project would be constructed in phases. Additional comments regarding architectural and landscaping refinement were deferred until a future date. Vote: 5-0

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following items on the consent calendar on April 25.

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

1620 U Street, SE, HPA #13-282, construction of two-story house.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

123 6th Street, SE, HPA #13-262, concept/side addition
432 New Jersey Avenue, SE, HPA #13-263, concept/side addition (renewal of 2007 concept approval).
(*Metzger recused*)
1013 E Street, SE, HPA #13-259, concept/rear addition.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3430 34th Place, NW, HPA #13-272, concept/addition and widen driveway. (*Casarella recused*)

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

411 Ridge Street NW, HPA #13-270, concept/new three-story, 2-unit flats.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

2001 14th Street, NW, HPA #13-152, concept/roof top canopy

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, <u>www.olenderreporting.com,or info@OlenderReporting.com</u>. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <u>http://planning.dc.gov</u>