HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

| Property Address: | 2122 P Street, NW | | Agenda |
|--------------------|---------------------------------|---|----------------|
| Landmark/District: | Dupont Circle Historic District | | Concept Review |
| Meeting Date: | October 26, 2023 | Х | Permit Review |
| H.P.A. Number: | 23-512 | | Alteration |

Working with architect Ron Schneck of Square 134 Architects, owner JRB 2122 P St LLC seeks the Board's review of a concept to add on top of 2122 P Street NW in the Dupont Circle Historic District. The structure is one of three connected apartment buildings constructed in 1906 by developer Franklin Sanner. Named the Thearle, 2122 P is the only one of the three that remains; the Charlotte and Lindbergh Apartments were demolished sometime after 1970 and before the 2002 construction of the Marriott Residences, now occupying the lots to the east.



Project Description

The concept envisions a two-story addition above the existing four-story building. It would sit back 12'3" from the front and occupy the full width of the building. The setback is determined by the existing interior stair and the desire to extrude it upward. The cladding would be metal panels with windows that align above the windows of the existing building.

The building has been altered on the front, possibly due to a lowered grade for P Street. It currently features flush storefronts at the street level and shallow bay projections on the second floor. On the alley side, the front windows have been enlarged on the second floor while the others on this level were infilled with brick.

Evaluation

Generally, the Board's principle is that rooftop additions should not be visible or overwhelm the underlying building. That principle is informed by site-specific circumstances, including building type, height, and context.

This building is a conventional low-rise apartment building, as defined by the District's Multiple Property Document *Apartment Buildings in Washington*, *D.C.1880-1945*. These ubiquitous buildings are less than five stories tall and were purpose-built to absorb the ever-expanding population of the District. They adopted styles and details appropriate to their dates of construction, notably the Colonial and Classical Revival styles.

Because of their low scale and the symmetry and proportionality demanded by their style, these buildings do not lend themselves well to roof additions. The subject building is especially problematic given the full visibility of the roof from the west. What would result from the proposal is an unbalanced, top-heavy massing which takes away from its relevance as the only remaining historic building in this stretch of P Street and a reminder of its former residential scale.

The HPO has indicated a willingness to work with the applicant on an alternative design that would be more compatible with the building. Staff finds merit in either a one-story addition in the same proposed footprint, which offers a more proportional appearance, or a taller addition that is pushed back further, which may be acceptable based on the context of taller surrounding buildings. A third option, which was explored in part by the applicant, would create a one story addition over the stairs only which then steps up to a second floor pushed back further on the roof.

Recommendation

Due to the compromised context surrounding this building, the opportunity for a roof addition exists here. However, the design must respect the scale, proportions, and massing of the underlying building.

The HPO recommends that the applicant explore the options suggested above and return to the Board when ready.

Staff contact: Anne Brockett