
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Landmark/District:	Cleveland Park Historic District	<input type="checkbox"/> Agenda
Address:	3704 Quebec Street NW	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Consent
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Permit
Meeting Date:	October 22, 2015	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alteration
Case Number:	15-623	<input type="checkbox"/> New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Frances McMillen	<input type="checkbox"/> Demolition
		<input type="checkbox"/> Subdivision

Applicant Nicholas Netchvolodoff requests permit review for roof replacement at 3704 Quebec Street NW in the Cleveland Park Historic District.

Property Description

Constructed in 1927, 3704 Quebec Street is a two-story Tudor Revival house that was designed by W.R. Lamar for owner/ builder W.D. Sterrett. Clad in brick and stucco, it is the center in a row of three houses designed and built in 1927-1928. 3708 Quebec to the west, also designed by Lamar for Sterrett, and 3700 to the east are each two-story, brick Colonial Revivals.

Proposal

The proposal calls for replacing the existing asphalt shingle roof with CertainTeed's Landmark Pro Architectural shingle in burnt sienna.

Evaluation

A review of the permit records for the subject property found slate listed as the roof material. Despite this, it is questionable whether the material was actually used given its longevity and that this would be the second roof replacement in the span of only 88 years. Further research reveals that Lamar designed numerous houses for Sterett in Cleveland Park, including the majority of residences on Rowland Place and several on 33rd Place. His designs are all relatively stripped down versions of Colonial and Tudor Revival styles -- of which 3704 Quebec is a good example -- styles popular in the 1920s and '30s. A review of building permits and on-site observation of many of Lamar and Sterrett's projects in Cleveland Park reveal asphalt and composite shingles, rather than slate, were and remain the primary roof materials chosen for these houses.

In the context of this row of three dissimilar houses, one of the other houses has a slate roof and the other has an asphalt roof. The house is not one of a coordinated row of buildings or a uniform development, such as Foxhall Village, that share matching roof materials that are an important and uniform character defining feature. In that type of context, the use of a substitute or non-historic material frequently detracts from the overall character of the buildings.

Given the absence of historical documentation that this roof was actually clad in slate, documentation that similar houses constructed by the same architect/builder were not built with slate, and a disparate context in which slate is not uniform characteristic, a replacement asphalt roof would not be incompatible with this property.

Recommendation

Recommend the Board find asphalt to be a compatible material for the roof with the condition the applicant work with staff on the selection of a shingle.