HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

1	3617 Newark Street NW Cleveland Park Historic District	$\begin{pmatrix} \\ \end{pmatrix}$	Agenda Consent Calendar
Landmark/District.	Cievelanu I al & Historic District		
			Concept Review
		()	Permit Review
Meeting Date:	November 17, 2022	(X)	Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	23-033	()	New Construction
		()	Demolition
		()	Subdivision

The applicant, architect Eric F. Teran, agent for property owners Jeremy Marcus and Una Lee, seeks concept review to add a second story to an existing one-story rear accessory structure. The existing structure is non-contributing to the Cleveland Park Historic District.

Proposal

The accessory structure sits in the rear yard of 3617 Newark Street, NW. Both the house and accessory structure are non-contributing buildings. The main house was built in 1988 and no work is proposed for that building. The applicant proposes to add a second story to the existing accessory structure, increasing its height from approximately 10' tall to approximately 19' 11" tall. The first story would be clad in horizontal clapboards and the second story will have vertical siding; the building would be capped by a cross gable roof like the existing structure. The building will be in view of a U-shaped public alley accessible from Norton Place. In addition, a wood trellis approximately 8' 9" in height will be built in the yard between the main house and accessory building. The trellis will not be in view from the alley. Neither the proposed trellis nor second-story addition to the accessory building will be viewable from Newark Street or Norton Place.

Evaluation

Though two-story garages and secondary structures are not common among the public alleys of Cleveland Park, that scale would be very typical of the structures fronting the U-shaped alley off Norton Place that this proposed structure would front. That alley is one of the rare public ways in the neighborhood that is characterized by a tight, built-up appearance more typical of the alleys of denser neighborhoods like Dupont Circle. Of the fifteen structures that currently abut the alley, eleven are two stories tall, one is four stories, and only three (including the existing accessory building in question) are one story tall. Many of the buildings directly touch the alley or are within 20' of it, further helping to accentuate the alley's tightness and sheer walls. Turning the accessory building into a two-story structure would make it similarly sized to almost three quarters of the alley's other structures and would provide balance to the alley's existing appearance.

In addition, the proposal will replace a garage door on the existing structure's west elevation (which directly fronts the alley) with a single pedestrian doorway. All the garage structures currently abutting the alley are one story while all the residential structures are two stories or taller. By appearing residential in function, the proposed second-story addition will appropriately match the other two-story structures abutting the alley in both massing and use.

The proposed design's use of contrasting cladding on the first and second stories also helps to diminish its perceived massing. The first story cladding extends higher than the actual first floor so as to make the second story appear almost like a half story. The Board has found several nearby proposals for taller structures to be compatible when they are expressed in a similar manner as the proposal. Examples include: construction of an 18' 10" two-story garage at 3519 Lowell Street, NW (HPA 22-141, March 2022); conversion of a one-story garage to a 15'4" tall accessory dwelling unit at 3406 Rodman Street, NW (HPA 16463, Sept 2016); a new 20' tall two-story garage with loft at 3225 33rd Place, NW (HPA 17-421, June 2017); a 19' tall second story addition to one-story garage at 3503 Woodley Road, NW (HPA 19-136, Jan 2019); and a new 26' tall two-story accessory structure at 3411 Ordway Street, NW (HPA 20-178, Feb 2020).

The dimensions of the proposal's windows are also smaller than typical residential windows and are more appropriately sized for a barn or carriage house, a look that helps it relate to other larger Cleveland Park accessory dwellings. The design thus complements historic precedents while not fully mimicking them.

Recommendation

HPO recommends that the Board find the concept for the second-story addition to the rear accessory structure compatible with the historic district, and that final review be delegated to staff.

Staff contact: Todd Jones