## HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

| Landmark/District: | Cleveland Park Historic District | ( ) Agenda <br> Address: |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | 3601 35th Street NW | (x) Consent <br> (x) Concept |
| Meeting Date: | December 18, 2014 | (x) Alteration <br> Case Number: |
| (15-070 | ()New Construction |  |
| Staff Reviewer: | Frances McMillen | () Demolition |
|  |  | ( ) Subdivision |

Applicant Baron Bernstein, with drawings prepared by Hayes Architects, requests concept review for a side addition, stair enclosure and garage demolition at 3601 35th Street NW in the Cleveland Park Historic District.

## Property Description

Constructed in 1915, $360135^{\text {th }}$ Street was designed by E.C. Oliver for Hight \& Co. The house is a two-story frame building with a clipped gable roof. Fenestration primarily consists of unusual diamond pane casement windows. A single-story enclosed porch is located on the east side of the house. A partially collapsed wood frame garage is located along the east property line.

## Proposal

The proposal calls for adding a second floor to the side porch and a deck to the first floor, enclosing the rear staircase, and demolition of the garage. The submission includes two options for the addition's roof: a clipped gable similar to the house and a slightly pitched roof. Three options were submitted for the fenestration and include a mix of individual and ganged pairs of casement windows. The addition would be clad in cedar shake siding to match the house.

## Evaluation

The addition is generally compatible with the house, but aspects of the proposal are in need of further development. The applicant has worked with staff and updated the fenestration and roof form. The submission includes an illustration from a 1912 brochure for the house that includes a two-story side porch with a flat roof. The two proposed roof forms are not compatible with the house. Although the clipped gable roof is referential to the original building, it results in the loss of an attic window and isn't sufficiently secondary to the main mass of the house. The lower height of the pitched roof allows for the retention of the attic window, but the style is not appropriate for the house. A flat roof (pitched sufficiently for drainage) similar to the original brochure is recommended.

Of the three window proposals the paired ganged windows with the rounded openings are the most successful. They are similar in style and symmetrical with the doors on the porch's first floor. The applicant is encouraged to work with staff on the selection of windows and doors as
divided lights may be more successful in retaining the porch-like character of the side wing and in complementing the house's diamond pane windows where the rear stair is enclosed. The size of the window openings requires close attention on the addition and at the rear stair enclosure so their proportions are compatible with the original house.

The submission includes a structural engineer's report detailing the condition of the garage. The loss of this structure is unfortunate, but the building is in a state of collapse and has lost its integrity.

## Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the concept compatible with the house and the historic district and delegate final approval to staff with the condition the design for the side addition is revised to include a flat roof and applicant continue to work with staff on the selection of windows, doors, siding, and other materials.

