HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Property Address: Landmark/District: Meeting Date: H.P.A. Number:	3415 Porter Street NW Cleveland Park Historic District May 24 th , 2018 18-129	Agenda Consent Calendar Concept Review Alteration New Construction Demolition
		Subdivision

Architect Josh Van Donge requests concept review for construction of a shed dormer, rear roof alteration, and alterations to an existing rear addition, at 3415 Porter Street NW.

Built in 1920 by architects Alexander Sonnemann and Louis Justement, 3415 Porter is a detached, two-story, foursquare house with a central projecting bay at the first-story and two bay openings at the second-story. The property is clad with aluminum siding and features a brick porch that wraps from the southern, front, façade to the entry on the east elevation.

Proposal

This project proposes a to remove a two-story existing addition at the rear and reconstruct a new addition with a balcony in roughly the same footprint. The applicant also proposes to construct a new shed dormer at the east and west slopes of the roof. Additional work includes replacing the aluminum siding with stucco, and relocating the existing garage closer to the rear of the house, altering the garage roof for a deck, and incorporating it into the new work at the rear.

Evaluation

Compatibility for the work at the rear is achieved by locating the work at a secondary elevation that will not be visible from the street. The unusual treatment for the roof at the rear is successful by maintaining the proper relationship with the windows below through preserving the existing eave line. Retaining the hip at the roof ridgeline assists in envisaging the original angles of the hip.

The shed dormers are generally compatible as a traditional alteration on free standing homes in the district. Compatibility in scale and mass can be improved, in this case, by increasing the space between the dormer and the eave, as well as pulling the dormer back some from the ridge line of the roof to allow a better expression of the roof. This would also allow the dormers to read more clearly as true dormers, rather than a roof addition.

The spiral stair at the rear is not a recommended treatment for the historic district, and appears unnecessary. If required, a better solution would be to incorporate the spiral stair in the small second story rear porch and externally access that with a more traditional exterior stair. The stucco treatment for the siding is also not recommended, as the original permit states that 3415 was originally a frame build. The applicant should evaluate the condition of wood, if any,

underneath the existing aluminum siding and salvage that if possible. Otherwise, the house should be re-clad in wood clapboards.

A 1927 Sanborn Map indicates that the garage was built within seven years of the original construction, if it was not part of the original construction. The garage is currently in poor condition and will require significant work for use. While the garage likely was part of the original construction, it is in a location that is not visible from the street, and relocation could be considered, perhaps with a more significant retention of the historic form.



Figure 1: 1927 Sanborn (vol. 5) showing 3415 Porter Street NW and the garage at the rear.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Review Board find the concept for additions to be generally compatible with the character of the historic district, and delegate final approval to staff with the suggested changes to the rear stair, siding, dormers, and garage.

Staff Contact: Michael Robb