HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Landmark/District: Address:	Cleveland Park Historic District 3414 Newark Street NW	(x) Agenda () Consent
Maating Data:	November 10, 2015	(x) Concept
Meeting Date: Case Number:	November 19, 2015 16-047	(x) Alteration () New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Frances McMillen	() Demolition() Subdivision

Applicant 3414 Newark St LLC, with drawings prepared by GTM Architects, Inc., requests concept review for a basement expansion, a two-story rear addition, driveway widening, and construction of a free-standing garage at 3414 Newark Street NW in the Cleveland Park Historic District.

Property Description

Designed by Hunter and Bell for owner and builder Charles H. Taylor, 3414 Newark St was built in 1909. The subject property is a two-story, stucco clad Four Square style house with a front porch and a bay on the east elevation. The rear of the house consists of a basement level-garage below a three-story screened porch.

Proposal

The proposal calls for expanding the basement level, extending and widening the driveway, and constructing a rear addition and free-standing garage. The basement-level garage and the three-story rear porch and an attic dormer window would be demolished to accommodate the addition. The new garage would be located in the southeast corner of the property. The driveway would be widened to 12' just beyond the front porch. The proposal also includes a new asphalt shingle roof, window replacement and repair or in-kind replacement of the stucco cladding. The addition would be clad in stucco and Hardi plank siding.

Evaluation

The rear addition is compatible with the house and the historic district in terms of overall massing, scale, design, height, fenestration, and materials. The addition is smaller than the original house, establishing a subordinate relationship between new and old. The massing is broken up by the screen porch and one and two-story bays on the east and rear elevations helping to reduce the perceived size of the new construction. The use of siding on the rear two-story bay provides a porch-like character reminiscent of the existing rear porches, which are in very poor condition and beyond salvage.

A few minor refinements are suggested to improve the addition's compatibility and relationship to the house. Recessing the addition on the east elevation to differentiate it further from the original building is recommended, as is setting the first floor projection farther towards the back of the addition. As currently designed the projection is only a few feet from the existing east elevation bay creating an uncomfortably close relationship between the two.

The proposed garage is not incompatible with the house, but the applicant is encouraged to consider located the garage within the mass of the addition, similar to the existing garage, to reduce the impact on the site. Repairing the existing windows if possible, instead of the proposed replacement throughout the house, is also recommended. Adding some windows to the west elevation of the addition or other detailing is also recommended to break up the large expanse of blank wall.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the proposal compatible with the historic district and delegate final approval to staff with the condition the addition is recessed from the house on the east elevation, the first floor projection is set further back from the existing bay and the applicant work with staff on the selection of materials.