
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Landmark/District:	Capitol Hill Historic District	<input type="checkbox"/> Agenda
Address:	734 3rd St NE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Consent
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Concept
Meeting Date:	March 24, 2016	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alteration
Case Number:	16-261	<input type="checkbox"/> New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Paul Weishar	<input type="checkbox"/> Demolition
		<input type="checkbox"/> Subdivision

Applicant Nantucket Holdings, with plans prepared by W+W Associates Architects, requests concept review for a two-story rear addition, façade alterations to include brick repair, window and door replacements, and a garage demolition at 734 3rd Street, NE in the Capitol Hill Historic District.

Property Description

The west side of the 700 block of 3rd Street, NE is defined by a row of fifteen Queen Anne-style rowhouses (706-734) constructed in 1890. All the lots were owned by Senator John H. Sherman, an Ohio U.S. Representative and U.S. Senator from the Civil War until the late nineteenth century. He later served as Secretary of the Treasury under President Rutherford B. Hayes and as Secretary of State under President William McKinley. These fifteen Queen Anne-style rowhouses were constructed by Howarth & Yates following the design of architect Frederick G. Atkinson.

The rowhouse at 734 3rd Street, NE is the northernmost building on the street, set adjacent to a large multi-story commercial building within the H Street commercial corridor. The dwelling is constructed of brick and is set on a raised foundation; faced with pressed stretcher-bond brick. Embellishment of the façade includes brick string courses, a corbeled brick cornice, recessed brick panels, and nailhead molding. A single-leaf door (non-original) with single-light transom is set in the northernmost bay of the dwelling. A full-height canted bay projects from the southernmost bay of the façade, providing the principal visual interest for the building. The bay is capped by a slate-covered pyramidal roof which gives way to a false Mansard across the façade with a small shed-roof dormer. Window openings hold 1/1, double-hung vinyl sash set in segmental openings with concrete sills and soldier brick arches. A two-story ell with a parged exterior extends from the rear of the dwelling.

A detached one-story, one-bay brick garage of historic age is located near the rear of the property.

Proposal

The plans call for removing the rear ell and constructing an addition. The two-story, full-width addition will extend the footprint of the upper stories approximately 11 feet. The basement level will be extended approximately 18 feet west from the existing rear foundation wall. The (west) rear elevation of the addition will be clad in HardiPlank and capped by a flat roof with aluminum gutter system. Fenestration will include tripled single-leaf glass doors on the first story accessed via stairs and tripled 1/1, double-hung vinyl sash on the second story. The basement will have a single-leaf door opening as well as a paired window opening.

Efforts on the façade (east elevation) include the replacement of windows and main entry door. Furthermore, the façade will be repointed and multiple window arches rebuilt. Alterations to public space include the replacement of the areaway steps, replacement of the metal steps, stoop, and railing, and the reconstruction of an existing brick retaining wall.

The one-story, one-bay garage near the rear of the property will be demolished and replaced with a parking pad. The applicant indicated the desire to construct a privacy fence along the east side of the parking pad to provide additional turn-around space at the end of the alley.

Evaluation

The proposed two-story rear addition is compatible with the historic house and with the Capitol Hill Historic District in overall massing, height, fenestration, and materials. The Board has generally cited the principle that additions to historic buildings should not exceed the size of the original structure, establishing a deferential or subordinate relationship between new and old which this proposed addition does. In the context of the subject property, a two-story rear addition would not be out of context or incompatible with its surroundings. Furthermore, the addition would not extend beyond the massing of 732 3rd Street, NW nor be visible from the street view.

The replacement of the façade windows and door, as well as repairs to the exterior fabric, does not raise preservation concerns as these alterations positively affect the building's integrity.

Razing the garage at the rear of the property does not raise preservation concerns as it has diminished integrity of design, materials, and workmanship. Furthermore, the building has compromised integrity of setting and feeling due to the demolition of the rowhouses (and associated outbuildings) on the west side of the block, repaving of the alley with modern brick, and the subsequent construction of large multi-story commercial buildings to the west and north of the alley. As a result, the garage is no longer part of an intact alley-scape. As the garage is set back from the alley, it does not reinforce the alley-scape.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board approve the concept as consistent with the purposes of the preservation act and delegate final approval to staff with the condition the applicant work with staff on the retention of historic fabric, detailing, and the final selection of materials related to the proposed façade repairs as well as any alterations to the public space in front of the building.