
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Landmark/District:	Capitol Hill Historic District	<input type="checkbox"/> Agenda
Address:	213 11th Street, SE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Consent
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Concept
Meeting Date:	January 22, 2015	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alteration
Case Number:	15-052	<input type="checkbox"/> New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Sarah VanLandingham	<input type="checkbox"/> Demolition
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Subdivision

Applicants David and Martha Dantzie with plans prepared by architect Garrett Pressick of Bell Architects seek concept approval for a second-story addition to a one-story rear garage in the Capitol Hill Historic District.

Property Description

The subject building is a five-bay one story red brick garage located on the alley at the rear of 213 and an otherwise empty lot where 215 would be. Based on permit research, it was constructed in 1919. The building appears to still have its original tin roof, has not been significantly altered on the exterior and shows no evidence of structural deterioration. The yard-facing side has four small windows and a pedestrian door with arched brick headers; the building is largely hidden from 11th Street by extensive vegetation.

Although not typical of the city's private garages, there are other examples of these "garage rows" on Capitol Hill. The alley buildings survey identified 786 single-bay garages in the Capitol Hill Historic District vs. 13 multi-bay ones. This alley contains 13 buildings total, including two two-story brick stables, and 11 one-story garages. One of these two-story stables abuts the garage to the north (at the rear of 211 11th St SE).

Proposal

The plans call for adding a second story to cover three bays of the existing building. The addition would be brick and feature three two-over-two windows with sills on the alley side. A soldier course of brick would stretch across the top of the building and act as a header for the windows. All of the bays on the first floor would have matching wood carriage doors.

On the yard side, for zoning reasons, a wood trellis is proposed to connect the garage to the house. It would connect to the pedestrian door and be supported by columns on low walls. Three of the four existing windows on the yard side would remain but one would be filled in with brick to accommodate the interior alterations.

Like the alleyside, the new second floor yard side would feature three two-over-two windows. A soldier course would be added at the top of the first floor to distinguish the addition from the original building.

As part of the project, the plans call for combining lots 804 and 805 (213 and 215 11th St SE).

Evaluation

The Board recently reviewed an addition to another multi-bay garage in Capitol Hill at 15 Brown's Court. In that case, the Board approved a proposal to remove a non-contributing second story and replace it with a new second story covering approximately 5/6ths of the building and a deck covering the remaining 1/6th. The second floor was clad in a contrasting material to clearly indicate it as a later addition. While not identical to this project, that plan provides a useful example.

When the project was first proposed, it consisted of a second story addition that covered the entire first story. That plan would have substantially changed the character of this somewhat unusual one-story, five-bay garage by doubling its mass and altering its impact on the alley-scape. By contrast, the current scaled-down proposal to put an addition on only three out of the five bays allows the historic one-story building to remain dominant and the addition to be secondary. By locating the addition over the three bays to the north, it will be less visible through the open lot at 215.

Under this proposal the majority of the historic structure would be maintained with the exception of the roof and one window opening on the yard side being filled in with brick. The proposal also calls for restoring the appearance of the garage bays on the alley.

In reviewing the project with regard to its context – another important consideration the Board has cited -- the presence of other two-story buildings in this alley helps to make the case for adding a second story to this one. The guidelines state that additions should be “compatible with the existing building [but] . . . the design of the addition should be distinct enough so that it does not appear to have always existed.” In this proposal, the addition is a similar material as the historic building (brick) but its location above the substantial cornice makes it clear that it was not original. This distinction is further supported by the inclusion of a soldier course on the yard side of the building.

The proposal to combine the two adjacent lots (804 and 805) is appropriate since the garage already spans the two and there has historically never been a front building on lot 805.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the concept of the addition and subdivision to be compatible with the Capitol Hill Historic District and delegate final approval to staff.