HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Landmark/District: **Capitol Hill Historic District**

114 12th Street NE Address:

ANC: **6A**

Meeting Date: **September 30, 2021**

Case Number: 21-442 (**x**) Agenda

() Consent

(x) Concept (**x**) Alteration

() New Construction

() Demolition

() Subdivision

Applicants Arthur Melzer and Shikha Dalmia, with plans by architect Tenika Felder, seek concept review for construction of second story additions on a garage located in the Capitol Hill Historic District.



Views of 114 12th Street NE garage from the alley

Property Description

At the interior of the block are a mix of garages and carriage houses, in addition to fenced yards. The property abuts a three-story carriage house that faces Walter Houp Court NE. The garage is one of two one-story garages in a row, next to a perpendicular row of fenced yards.



Aerial view of the garage at 114 12th Street NE (indicated with red star)

Proposal

A frame second story would be added over about two-thirds of the footprint of the existing garage for a total height of about twenty feet. The alley-facing elevation would show the off-set from the adjacent carriage house party wall. At the second story there would be two off-center small horizontal windows.

Evaluation

The Board's numerous approvals for second-story additions to garages have largely consisted of projects where the addition's material matched the existing garage (where retained). With brick walls being carried up on sidewalls with a return on the front, or in some instances with sidewalls being stuccoed to emulate the appearance of parged walls. The Board has also generally supported regular facades, with additions spanning the full footprint of the garage on the alley elevation, with regularized double-hung windows.

This project as designed does not align with the Board's previous approvals. It has been recommended that revisions be made to the material and windows, and that the false front be moved from garden-facing elevation to alley-facing elevation. However, it must be noted that this property is largely not visible from most of the alley, or from Walter Houp Court NE. And so, though the project is not compatible with historic alley garage or carriage house forms, the potential impact on the historic district is minimal.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends the Board find the proposal to be compatible with the Capitol Hill Historic District if the material and windows are revised and the alley elevation made to span the full-width of the garage, and delegate final approval to staff.

Staff contact: Moira Nadal