HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

Property Address: Landmark/District:	1317 Naylor Court NW Blagden Alley-Naylor Court Historic District	() Agenda (X) Consent Calendar
ANC:	2F	() Denial Calendar
		(X) Concept Review
Meeting Date:	September 24, 2015	(X) Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	#15-576	() New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Brendan Meyer	() Demolition
	·	() Subdivision

The applicant, Kube Architecture on behalf of owners Nicholas Rubenstein and Kobi Hsu, seeks conceptual design review for a setback 1-story addition on top of a one-story commercial garage that contributes to the character of the Blagden Alley-Naylor Court Historic. Plans were prepared by the applicant.

Property Description and Context

Blagden Alley and Naylor Court Historic District was designated in 1990 as a significant example of 19th century working class housing and for its association with the early 20th century social reform movement. Original dwellings were small and simple—generally unornamented brick, two-stories tall and two bays wide—and built for Washington's working class. Warehouses and commercial stables were built on larger lots. After the turn of 20th century, alley dwellings were frequently replaced with private garages. 1317 Naylor Court NW is an example of this latter history; the original 1882 two-story brick dwelling was replaced in 1919 by the current one-story garage. To the east, 1317 Naylor is attached to one of the biggest historic buildings in the district, the Tally-Ho stables. Across the alley to the east is a large surface parking lot that allows views of 1317 Naylor from 10th Street.

Proposal

The concept design submission includes multiple options for a set-back one-story addition on top of 1317 Naylor. Setback options are at 6 feet and 12 feet. A variety of fenestration patterns are offered for the second floor ranging from large expanses of glass similar in scale to the vehicular opening on the ground floor front façade to smaller punched openings. Cladding materials include coreten steel or cement board. In every option the partially bricked in vehicle opening at the ground floor will be opened up to its original size.

Evaluation

For additions, proposed work should be judged both for compatibility with the affected building and for its effect on the historic district. Historic properties may merit different levels of treatment or attention depending on their relative historic and architectural significance. For instance, greater flexibility is typically given for alterations to a historic garage than for a prominent historic church. 1317 Naylor is inherently a modest building that does not have architectural distinction or presence. Considering its lack of architectural significance, a one-story addition set back sufficiently from the front façade would allow the original form of the building below to remain discernable. The addition would be visible, but from the alley it would

be bracketed on each side by a 2-story building, and from a distance the addition would be back-dropped by the much larger Tally-Ho stables. No change to the skyline of the alley would be apparent.

Option C shown on page A-119, with one small adjustment, is compatible with the character of the historic district in terms of size, rhythm and scale of its second floor openings and the 12-foot setback preserves the one-story character of the historic building. The small recommended adjustment is that the single lintel that spans over both pairs of windows should be broken into two separate lintels in order to accentuate the human scale of the second floor in contrast to the larger vehicular scale of the ground floor opening.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Review Board find the concept for a setback 1-story addition on top of the 1-story garage at 1317 Naylor Court NW to be compatible with the character of the historic district, consistent with the purpose of the preservation act, and that final approval be delegated to Staff.