

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Property Address:	2323 Porter Street, NW	X	Agenda
Landmark/District:	Pine Crest Manor (Greystone Enclave)		Consent Calendar
Meeting Date:	May 31, 2012	X	Concept Review
H.P.A. Number:	12-307	X	Alteration
Staff Reviewer:	Anne Brockett		New Construction

Owner/architect Michael Marshall seeks the Board’s concept review for an addition on his home, Pine Crest Manor, which is part of the Greystone Enclave bordering on Rock Creek Park. The simple Tudor Revival style and asymmetrical form of the house reflect the popularity of eclectic revival styles common when the house was built in 1929. As stated in the DC Landmark nomination, “Typical of the architecture of the 1920s, the massing and silhouette of the house take precedence over ornament and decorative detail.”

Project Description

The addition would significantly increase the size of this small house, but would be entirely located behind it. It will be visible from Porter Street and its connection to Beach Drive, but these areas are outside of the Enclave or a historic district. Elements of the form, style, and materials are pulled from the Tudor aesthetic. The stone foundation, half-timbered walls, metal roof, and multi-pane upper windows reflect the existing materials on the house.

The addition is lower in height than the block of the house and would be set in considerably on the right side and slightly set in on the left, where a round breakfast nook is proposed. This one-story nook would project slightly further out from the side wall of the house and would feature full-height Gothic windows below a second floor deck. Throughout the rest of the addition, glazing consists of single light French doors on the first floor and 6/6 sashes on the second floor and on the right elevation.

The first floor at the rear would be a screened porch. No changes are proposed to the front or sides of the original house.

Evaluation

The proposed addition is generally compatible with the landmark; however, the HPO offers several recommendations to enhance its compatibility. Pine Crest Manor, despite its name, is actually quite a small cottage with a very simple form and features. While it is appropriate to pull from the Tudor Revival for inspiration in designing the addition – stucco and wood trim are seen in the original dormer – a more restrained approach is recommended. The addition is highly ornate and formal with elaborate faux timbering in the gable ends, which should be reduced in order to keep the architectural focus on the historic part of the house.

The HPO recommends elimination of the round, projecting portion of the addition as its form, position, and fenestration are not compatible with the existing rectilinear form of Pine Crest.

Not including the round projection, the articulation proposed on the addition is quite successful in terms of breaking down its mass. However, adding windows to the first floor of the right side (as shown in plan, but not elevation) would help break up this expanse of wall. The use of multi-pane windows and doors throughout the addition would better reflect the Tudor Revival style.

Archaeology

A Phase 1 archaeological survey was conducted in 1989 and recommended further testing on the property, including directly behind the house, where historic artifacts and possibly a former outbuilding of Joshua Peirce's Linnaean Hill were located. Mr. Marshall has agreed to work with the HPO on further archaeological exploration on site prior to construction, which will benefit the District as a whole in creating a better understanding the city's agrarian past, particularly the Peirce family's nursery business and their enslaved workforce.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the addition to be compatible with the character of the historic landmark and consistent with the preservation act, with the following conditions:

1. Eliminate the round nook on the left side of the building
2. Simplify the architectural details of the addition to better reflect the austerity of Pine Crest
3. Add windows on the first floor of the right side to break up the solid wall
4. Consider using multi-pane French doors and windows throughout the addition
5. Work with HPO to determine and carry out an appropriate level of archaeological investigation

The HPO further requests delegation of final approval to staff.