

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
May 24, 2012

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on May 24.

Present: Catherine Buell, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Gretchen Pfaehler, Nancy Metzger, Robert Sonderman, and Joseph Taylor.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The HPRB approved the following items on the consent calendar. Vote: 8-0 (Casarella absent)

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

1116 I Street, SE, HPA #12-315, concept/rear addition

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3411 Quebec Street NW, HPA #12-358, concept/rear addition

3523 Quebec Street NW, HPA #12-359, concept/rear addition and recladding of side porch (case deferred by request of the owner)

14TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1508 14th Street, NW, HPA #12-353, concept/addition, storefront alterations

SIXTEENTH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1100 16th Street, NW, HPA #12-344, concept/exterior rehabilitation

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

6800 6th Street NW, HPA #12-356, concept/add two dormers to roof

MAY 24TH AGENDA

HISTORIC LANDMARK

(CONTINUATION OF APRIL 26 MEETING)

First Church of Christ, Scientist, 1770 Euclid Street, NW (*pending landmark*), HPA #12-209, revised concept/nine-story rear addition for hotel.

The Board voted to approve the revised project as compatible with the character of the church and consistent with the design direction given to the applicants by the HPRB in 2008. The Board asked for further study of the porte-cochere/first floor treatment of the Champlain Street frontage to make it more urban and pedestrian-friendly, further study of the fenestration and materials with the goal of scaling the building down and making it more vertical in orientation, and that the top of the building and the penthouse continue to be further developed in design. Vote: 6-3 (Metzger, Davidson, Ally opposed).

LANDMARK HEARINGS

Park View School, 3570 Warder Street, NW, Case #11-23.

The Board designated the school, including the interior of its auditorium, a landmark to be entered in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites and requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places with a recommendation for listing as of local significance, with a period of significance of 1916 to 1931. Vote: 9-0.

LANDMARK HEARINGS

Tiber Island, Square 502, Case #12-01.

The Board designated Tiber Island a landmark to be entered in the District of Columbia Inventory of Historic Sites and requested that the State Historic Preservation Officer forward the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 8-1 (Buell opposed)

HISTORIC LANDMARK/SIXTEENTH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

Christian Science Monitor Building, 900 16th Street, NW, HPA #12-035.

The Board found that the proposed construction in excess of the 90-foot height limit to be incompatible with the character of the Sixteenth Street Historic District and the urban design character of a major contributing element of the L'Enfant Plan. The Board encouraged the applicant to revise the project within the existing height restrictions and to strengthen its design compatibility with the historic context. Vote: 5-2 (Ally and Aurbach opposed; Casarella and Buell recused).

HISTORIC LANDMARK

McMillan Park Reservoir, Consideration of draft Master Plan and Design Guidelines.

With insufficient time remaining for the presentation, the project was deferred at the request of the applicant. *The proposal has been rescheduled for Thursday July 12, 2012 at 10:00AM.*

MAY 31ST HPRB AGENDA

The Historic Preservation Review Board met and considered the following items on May 31, 2012.

Present: Catherine Buell, Chair; Rauzia Ally, Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Gretchen Pfaehler, and Joseph Taylor. Absent: Bob Sonderman

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

650 New York Avenue, HPA #12-305, concept/alteration, new construction, demolition, building relocation and subdivision.

The Board found the general preservation approach, building relocation, and extent of new construction to be appropriate for the site. Despite extensive loss of the structures, the majority of the Board encouraged the retention and reuse of the building facades on L Street and that the removal of remaining portions of those buildings constituted an acceptable level of alteration. The Board encouraged further development of the scheme that relocated the two historic buildings to the east of the site (rather than to the west) and further development of the design of the new construction, and that the project return for further review when appropriate. No vote taken; comments sufficient to provide guidance to applicant.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

Florida Avenue and 9th Street, NW, HPA #12-159, revised concept/new construction.

The Board found the incremental changes made to the storefront design and setbacks since last being presented to improve the proposal but found them insufficient in fully addressing their concerns about the compatibility of the design. The Board directed the applicants to give further study to the blocky, boxy, horizontal quality of the buildings, and more study of the scale, texture, rhythm, and vertical orientation found in the surrounding historic district for inspiration. The Board voted to direct the applicant to continue working with the HPO and return for further review when appropriate. Vote: 6-0 (Casarella and Buell recused).

TAKOMA PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

7222 Blair Road NW, HPA #12-119, new curb cut and driveway.

The Board found the project to be compatible with the character of the historic district and consistent with the preservation act, with the following conditions: (a) that the new retaining wall be no higher than 3½ feet along the sidewalk; (b) a secondary retaining wall of no more than 5 feet above the sidewalk grade be constructed with sufficient room for a planting bed to be installed between the two walls (c) the 6 foot high rear yard fence be placed at least several feet behind the uppermost retaining wall. The Board delegated final approval to HPO. Vote: 8-0.

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3215 Newark Street, NW, HPA #12-342, concept/solar panels.

The Board found the placement of solar panels on the original roof incompatible with the character of the historic district and not consistent with the preservation act. They found that placing solar panels on the roof of the addition or on any part of the rear of the property is compatible and consistent with the preservation act. Vote 4-3-1 (Casarella, Aurbach, Davidson opposed; Buell abstained).

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Tregaron, Klinge Road, HPA #12-311, concept/subdivision, fence.

The Board found the proposed five foot iron fence and associated landscape planting plans around the residential lot on Klinge Road to be consistent with the goal of preserving the character of Tregaron's landscape and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act, as long as the placement followed natural topographical features and was located at natural edges of the site. The Board delegated final placement location approval to staff. Vote: 7-0 (Casarella and Sonderman absent)

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1250 9th Street, NW, HPA #12-301, concept/new construction, alteration.

The Board determined the existing structure at 902 N Street NW to be a non-contributing structure in the Shaw Historic District and Blagden Alley/Naylor Court Historic Districts, and that the extent of removal of the rear portion of 1250 9th Street, NW to constitute an acceptable level of alteration to the building, not constituting demolition under the act. The Board found the general concept for the proposed five-story building to be compatible with the historic district, but directed the applicant to return to the Board to provide renderings and elevations that clearly show the appearance and effect of any penthouses and roof structures before the Board delegates final approval to staff. Vote: 7-0 (Casarella and Sonderman absent)

926 N Street, NW, HPA #12-160, revised concept/new construction.

The Board adopted the staff report determining the revised concept to be compatible with the historic district and consistent with the purposes of the preservation act. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 7-0 (Casarella and Sonderman absent)

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

Pine Crest Manor (Greystone Enclave), 2323 Porter Street NW, HPA #12-307, concept/rear addition
The Board found the addition to be compatible with the character of the historic landmark and consistent with the preservation act, with the following conditions: (1) Eliminate or redesign the round nook on the left side of the building; (2) Simplify the architectural details of the addition to better reflect the austerity of Pine Crest; (3) Add windows on the first floor of the right side to break up the solid wall; (4) Consider using multi-pane French doors and windows throughout the addition; (5) Work with HPO to determine and carry out an appropriate level of archaeological investigation. Final approval was delegated to staff. Vote: 7-0 (Casarella and Sonderman absent)

The Augusta, 1151 New Jersey Avenue/216 New York Avenue, NW, HPA #12-360, alterations.
The Board supported the proposal and delegated further review of a permit application to staff, with the conditions that: (1) the canopy be attached to the building at the lintel of the basement door; (2) the window sashes only be replaced or, alternatively, the whole window units, with windows to match, as closely as possible, period dimensions and profiles; (3) the roof balcony not be constructed; (4) the elevator penthouse and rooftop mechanical units be cleared for permit subject to a successful mock-up or stick test that demonstrates they would not be prominently visible from a distance, with their prominence to be diminished by the selection of materials, etc.; (5) the guardrail be eliminated from the east side of the roof or moved so as not to be visible; (6) unnecessary paving be removed from the front yard/public space as suggested above, including some of the driveway surface, for the purpose of increasing planting and screening the trash area and transformer(s); (7) only a temporary sign be cleared under this application; (8) no trash enclosure be constructed in front of the building. Vote: 6-0 (Casarella, Aurbach and Sonderman absent)

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website and accessible through the following abbreviated URL: <http://tinyurl.com/68tvfr3>