

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Property Address:	3509 35th Street NW		Agenda
Landmark/District:	Cleveland Park Historic District	X	Consent Calendar
Meeting Date:	March 24, 2011	X	Concept Review
H.P.A. Number:	11-190	X	Alteration
Staff Reviewer:	Anne Brockett		New Construction

Owners Abigail Porter and David Kay, working with Nawrocki Architects, seek concept review for a two-story rear addition, one-story side addition, and front bay reconstruction at this Cleveland Park home. The house was constructed in 1926 by speculative builder Detlow Marthinson. The house has been significantly altered over time through a 1970s facade addition and bay window, the apparent enclosure of the front porch, chimney addition, and addition of a second floor porch. The house may have been re-stuccoed when the front addition and chimney were added. The smooth cemetitious coating is less characteristic of the date of construction than a more textural stucco with large aggregate additives (i.e. pebbledash).

Project Description

The project seeks to add to the rear and south side of the house. The 9-foot-deep rear addition would continue the existing lines of the house, carrying the gable roof and dormer form toward the back. Fenestration would largely be retained on the side walls, although some reconfiguration of windows is proposed on the north side. On the south side, a one-story addition would project 4½ feet from the side wall, but would remain tucked behind the existing side porch and would project no further than the front addition. It is designed to resemble an enclosed porch with large 6/6 windows above a paneled base. On the rear, the somewhat disorganized edifice will be made more formal and symmetrical with a centered series of French doors below a central second floor balcony.

On the front, the project calls for reconstruction of the 1970s bay window. The efforts will give a more traditional appearance to the bay through the installation of multi-light casement windows, a lowered hipped roof, and more decorative brackets beneath. In addition the windows of the front addition will be replaced with 6/6 sashes, matching the original configuration of windows on this house.

Evaluation

The design for the addition at this property has been substantially altered in response to staff comments. Initially a highly visible side gable addition was proposed, which would have significantly altered the form of this front gable-with-dormer residence. For the current design, the owner and architect prepared a study that would set the addition in slightly in height and width, which is a principle typically applied in the review of additions in Cleveland Park. However, given the nature of the house’s form and the modest scale of the addition, the break detracted from the overall design. In this particular instance, the HPO believes the more pleasing and unified architectural effect of simply continuing the existing form outweighs the goal of distinguishing new from old.

Because side additions have a greater potential for impacting the mass and composition of a building as seen by the public, they are given more careful review (and sometimes discouraged entirely) than non-visible rear additions. However, they can be found to be compatible in some instances. In this case, the shallow rear yard makes a deeper addition difficult and the side addition has been sensitively designed to resemble an enclosed porch with extensive fenestration. The house also has the advantage of an existing side porch, which will largely block the view of the addition. In response to HPO comments, the roofline of the side addition has been lowered to more closely resemble a side porch.

The design of the additions is consistent in form and materials with the house and the historic district. The changes to the façade will help bring a more compatible appearance to the 1970s additions and are a welcome alteration that better reflect the home’s Cleveland Park context.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board approve the project as designed and delegate final approval to staff.